

Tests of General Relativity with observations of the photon ring

Aaron Held

Philippe Meyer Junior Research Chair École Normale Supérieure





The central brightness depression:

• presence of a horizon Eichhorn, Held, Gold, ApJ 950 (2023) 2

Eichhorn, Held, JCAP 01 (2023) 032



Tests of General Relativity with observations of the photon ring

Aaron Held

Philippe Meyer Junior Research Chair École Normale Supérieure





- The central brightness depression:
- presence of a horizon Eichhorn, Held, Gold, ApJ 950 (2023) 2 Eichhorn, Held, JCAP 01 (2023) 032

Lensed emission feature: photon ring(s):

• map out (near-horizon) spacetime geometry Cárdenas-Avendaño, Held, PRD 109 (2024) 6, 064052



Tests of General Relativity with observations of the photon ring

Aaron Held

Philippe Meyer Junior Research Chair École Normale Supérieure





- 1) The Black Hole Explorer NASA SMEX proposal
- 2) Deviations from Kerr spacetime Delaporte, Eichhorn, Held, CQG 39 (2022) 13
- 3) Lensing-band constraints Cárdenas-Avendaño, Held, PRD 109 (2024) 6, 064052



Tests of General Relativity with observations of the photon ring

Aaron Held

Philippe Meyer Junior Research Chair École Normale Supérieure





Part I: The Black-Hole Explorer

The Event Horizon Telescope (EHT) ...



The Event Horizon Telescope (EHT) ...



... resolves the central brightness depression.

The Event Horizon Telescope (EHT) ...



... is limited by the diameter of earth.

The Blandt Holez ExpTetescope (EHT) ...



... is limited by the diameter of earth.

The Black Hole Explorer ...



- 3.5m antenna satellite
- ~20,000 km altitude orbit
- simultaneous dual-band observations (86 + 230/345 GHz)
- 2+ years observation time
- 100 Gbps laser downlink



The Black Hole Explorer ...



The Black Hole Explorer ...



... will resolve the first lensed image.

Part II: Parameterising deviations from Kerr spacetime

Kerr black holes ...



Kerr black holes ...





Delaporte, Eichhorn, Held, CQG 39 (2022) 13



Delaporte, Eichhorn, Held, CQG 39 (2022) 13



Delaporte, Eichhorn, Held, CQG 39 (2022) 13



$$\begin{split} g^{\mu\nu}\partial_{\mu}\partial_{\nu} &= \frac{1}{\mathsf{S}_{\mathsf{x}_1} + \mathsf{S}_{\mathsf{x}_2}} \Big[\left(\mathsf{G}_{\mathsf{x}_1}^{ij} + \mathsf{G}_{\mathsf{x}_2}^{ij}\right) \partial\mathsf{x}_i \partial\mathsf{x}_j \\ \text{Benenti, Francaviglia '79} &+ \Delta_{\mathsf{x}_1}\partial\mathsf{x}_1^2 + \Delta_{\mathsf{x}_2}\partial\mathsf{x}_2^2 \Big] \,. \end{split}$$

- rank-2 Killing tensor
- ^o 3rd constant of motion
- separable geodesic motion
- turns out to be circular

Delaporte, Eichhorn, Held, CQG 39 (2022) 13



Delaporte, Eichhorn, Held, CQG 39 (2022) 13



tt	gtr	${f g}_{{\sf t} heta}$	${f g}_{{f t}\phi}$
	g _{rr}	$g_{r heta}$	$g_{r\phi}$
		$\mathbf{g}_{ heta heta}$	$g_{ heta \phi}$
			$g_{\phi\phi}$

- in general 10 free functions
- 8 free functions (meridional coordinate freedom) Gourgoulhon, Bonazzola '93
- 6 free functions (general coordinate freedom) Petrov '61, Ayón-Beato et.Al '06

Delaporte, Eichhorn, Held, CQG 39 (2022) 13



$$ds^{2} = -\frac{N^{2}(r,\theta) - W^{2}(r,\theta)\sin^{2}\theta}{K^{2}(r,\theta)}dt^{2} - 2W(r,\theta)r\sin^{2}\theta dtd\phi + K^{2}(r,\theta)r^{2}\sin^{2}\theta d\phi^{2} + \Sigma(r,\theta)\left(\frac{B^{2}(r,\theta)}{N^{2}(r,\theta)}dr^{2} + r^{2}d\theta^{2}\right)$$
Konoplya, Rezzolla, Zhidenko, 1602.02378

 $ds^{2} = -\frac{N^{2}(r,\theta) - W^{2}(r,\theta)\sin^{2}\theta}{K^{2}(r,\theta)}dt^{2} - 2W(r,\theta)r\sin^{2}\theta dtd\phi + K^{2}(r,\theta)r^{2}\sin^{2}\theta d\phi^{2} + \Sigma(r,\theta)\left(\frac{B^{2}(r,\theta)}{N^{2}(r,\theta)}dr^{2} + r^{2}d\theta^{2}\right)$ Konoplya, Rezzolla, Zhidenko, 1602.02378

	Polynomial coefficients				Leading continued fraction				Suble continue	eading d fraction		
KRZ parameter	ϵ_0	a_{00}	b 00	k_{00}	ω_{00}	<i>a</i> ₀₁	b_{01}	k_{01}	ω_{01}	$ a_{02} b_{02} k_{02} \omega_{02} $	a_{03} b_{03} k_{03} ω_{03}	Cárdenas-Avendaño,
Kerr	$\left \frac{a^2}{r_0^2}\right $	0	0	$\left \frac{A_{\rm KRZ}^2}{r_0^2}\right $	$\left(1 + \frac{a^2}{r_0^2}\right) \frac{a}{r_0}$	0	0	0	0			Tiela, 2312.00390
$\mathcal{O}(r^{-n})$	1	2	1	0	1	3	2	1	2			
KRZ parameter	ϵ_1	a_{10}	b_{10}	k_{10}	ω_{10}	<i>a</i> ₁₁	b_{11}	k_{11}	ω_{11}	$a_{12} b_{12} k_{12} \omega_{12}$	$a_{13} b_{13} k_{13} \omega_{13}$	
Kerr	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0			
$\mathcal{O}(r^{-n})$	2	3	1	0	1	4	2	1	2			
KRZ parameter	ϵ_2	a ₂₀	b_{20}	k_{20}	ω_{20}	a_{21}	b_{21}	k_{21}	ω_{21}	$a_{22} b_{22} k_{22} \omega_{22}$	$a_{23} b_{23} k_{23} \omega_{23}$	
Kerr	0	$\left(1 + \frac{a^2}{r_0^2}\right) \frac{a^2}{r_0^2}$	0	0	0	$\left -\frac{a^4}{r_0^4}\right $	0	$\left -\frac{a^2}{r_0^2}\right $	0	$\left \begin{array}{c} 0 \end{array} \right - \left - \frac{a^2}{r_0^2} \right - $	$\left - \right - \left \frac{a^2}{r_0^2} \right - $	
$\mathcal{O}(r^{-n})$	2	3	1	0	1	4	2	1	2			
			÷					÷			:	

 $ds^{2} = -\frac{N^{2}(r,\theta) - W^{2}(r,\theta)\sin^{2}\theta}{K^{2}(r,\theta)}dt^{2} - 2W(r,\theta)r\sin^{2}\theta dtd\phi + K^{2}(r,\theta)r^{2}\sin^{2}\theta d\phi^{2} + \Sigma(r,\theta)\left(\frac{B^{2}(r,\theta)}{N^{2}(r,\theta)}dr^{2} + r^{2}d\theta^{2}\right)$ Konoplya, Rezzolla, Zhidenko, 1602.02378

		Polynor	olynomial coefficients			Leading continued fraction				Subleading continued fraction	
KRZ parameter	ϵ_0	a_{00}	b_{00}	k_{00}	ω_{00}	a_{01}	b_{01}	k_{01}	ω_{01}	$egin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	Cárdenas-Avendaño,
Kerr	$\frac{a^2}{r_0^2}$	0	0	$\frac{A_{\rm KRZ}^2}{r_0^2}$	$\left(1 + \frac{a^2}{r_0^2}\right) \frac{a}{r_0}$	0	0	0	0		Held, 2312.00590
$\mathcal{O}(r^{-n})$	léa	ding asym	pto	tics	1	nea	r ₂ h	orizo	on 2		
KRZ parameter	ϵ_1	a_{10}	b_{10}	k_{10}	ω_{10}	<i>a</i> ₁₁	b_{11}	k_{11}	ω_{11}	$a_{12} b_{12} k_{12} \omega_{12} a_{13} b_{13} k_{13} \omega_{13}$	
Kerr	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		
$\mathcal{O}(r^{-n})$	2	3	1	0	1	4	4 2 1 2		2		
KRZ parameter	ϵ_2	a_{20}	b_{20}	k_{20}	ω_{20}	<i>a</i> ₂₁	b_{21}	k_{21}	ω_{21}	$\begin{vmatrix} a_{22} & b_{22} & k_{22} & \omega_{22} \end{vmatrix} \begin{vmatrix} a_{23} & b_{23} & k_{23} & \omega_{23} \end{vmatrix}$	
Kerr	0	$\left(1+\frac{a^2}{r_0^2}\right)\frac{a^2}{r_0^2}$	0	0	0	$\left -\frac{a^4}{r_0^4}\right $	0	$\left -\frac{a^2}{r_0^2}\right $	0	$\left \begin{array}{c}0\end{array}\right -\left -\frac{a^2}{r_0^2}\right -\left \begin{array}{c}-\\-\end{array}\right -\left \frac{a^2}{r_0^2}\right -\left \begin{array}{c}-\\-\end{array}\right $	
$\mathcal{O}(r^{-n})$	2	3	1	0	1	4	2	1	2		
	:							:		:	

$$\Xi = (\mathsf{r}_0, \mathsf{M}, \mathsf{J}, \beta, \gamma, \mathsf{a}, \mathsf{a}_{01})$$

$$\begin{split} \mathbf{g}_{tt} &= -\frac{\left(\Delta_{\beta\gamma} + \frac{\mathbf{r}_{0}^{3}(\mathbf{r}-\mathbf{r}_{0})}{\mathbf{r}^{2}} \, \mathbf{a}_{01}\right) \sin^{2} \theta - \mathbf{g}_{t\phi}^{2}}{\mathbf{g}_{\phi\phi}} \\ \mathbf{g}_{rr} &= \frac{\Sigma \left(1 - \frac{(1-\gamma) \, \mathrm{M}}{\mathbf{r}}\right)^{2}}{\left(\Delta_{\beta\gamma} + \frac{\mathbf{r}_{0}^{3}(\mathbf{r}-\mathbf{r}_{0})}{\mathbf{r}^{2}} \, \mathbf{a}_{01}\right)} \\ \mathbf{g}_{\theta\theta} &= \Sigma = \mathbf{r}^{2} + \mathbf{A}^{2} \cos^{2} \theta \\ \mathbf{g}_{\phi\phi} &= \left[\mathbf{a}^{2} + \mathbf{r}^{2} + \frac{2\mathsf{M}\mathbf{r}\mathbf{a}^{2}}{\Sigma} \left(\frac{\mathsf{A}}{\mathbf{a}} - \frac{(\mathbf{a}^{2} + \mathbf{r}_{0}^{2})\cos^{2} \theta}{2 \, \mathsf{M} \, \mathbf{r}_{0}}\right)\right] \sin^{2} \theta \\ \mathbf{g}_{t\phi} &= -\frac{2\mathsf{M}\mathbf{r}\mathsf{A}\sin^{2} \theta}{\Sigma} \\ \mathbf{\Delta}_{\beta\gamma} &= \frac{(\mathbf{r} - \mathbf{r}_{0}) \left[\Delta - 2\mathsf{M}^{2}(\beta - \gamma + \frac{\mathbf{r}_{0}}{\mathsf{M}}) + \mathbf{r}_{0}(\mathbf{r} + \mathbf{r}_{0})\right]}{\mathbf{r}} \end{split}$$

• tell apart horizon location and asymptotic mass

r₀ M

$$\Xi = (\mathsf{r_0},\mathsf{M},\mathsf{J},\beta,\gamma,\mathsf{a},\mathsf{a_{01}})$$

$$\begin{split} g_{tt} &= -\frac{\left(\Delta_{\beta\gamma} + \frac{r_0^3(r-r_0)}{r^2} a_{01}\right) \sin^2 \theta - g_{t\phi}^2}{g_{\phi\phi}} \\ g_{rr} &= \frac{\sum \left(1 - \frac{(1-\gamma)M}{r}\right)^2}{\left(\Delta_{\beta\gamma} + \frac{r_0^3(r-r_0)}{r^2} a_{01}\right)} \\ g_{\theta\theta} &= \Sigma = r^2 + A^2 \cos^2 \theta \\ g_{\phi\phi} &= \left[a^2 + r^2 + \frac{2Mra^2}{\Sigma} \left(\frac{A}{a} - \frac{(a^2 + r_0^2)\cos^2 \theta}{2Mr_0}\right)\right] \sin^2 \theta \\ g_{t\phi} &= -\frac{2MrA\sin^2 \theta}{\Sigma} \\ \Delta_{\beta\gamma} &= \frac{(r-r_0) \left[\Delta - 2M^2(\beta - \gamma + \frac{r_0}{M}) + r_0(r+r_0)\right]}{r} \end{split}$$

•	tell apart horizon location and asymptotic mass	r ₀ M
•	tell apart horizon spin	a

$$\Xi = (\mathsf{r_0},\mathsf{M},\mathsf{J},\beta,\gamma,\mathsf{a},\mathsf{a_{01}})$$

$$\begin{split} \mathbf{g}_{tt} &= -\frac{\left(\Delta_{\beta\gamma} + \frac{\mathbf{r}_{0}^{3}(\mathbf{r}-\mathbf{r}_{0})}{\mathbf{r}^{2}} \mathbf{a}_{01}\right) \sin^{2}\theta - \mathbf{g}_{t\phi}^{2}}{\mathbf{g}_{\phi\phi}} \\ \mathbf{g}_{rr} &= \frac{\Sigma \left(1 - \frac{(1-\gamma)\,\mathbf{M}}{\mathbf{r}}\right)^{2}}{\left(\Delta_{\beta\gamma} + \frac{\mathbf{r}_{0}^{3}(\mathbf{r}-\mathbf{r}_{0})}{\mathbf{r}^{2}} \mathbf{a}_{01}\right)} \\ \mathbf{g}_{\theta\theta} &= \Sigma = \mathbf{r}^{2} + \mathbf{A}^{2}\cos^{2}\theta \\ \mathbf{g}_{\phi\phi} &= \left[\mathbf{a}^{2} + \mathbf{r}^{2} + \frac{2\mathsf{M}\mathbf{r}\mathbf{a}^{2}}{\Sigma} \left(\frac{\mathsf{A}}{\mathbf{a}} - \frac{(\mathbf{a}^{2} + \mathbf{r}_{0}^{2})\cos^{2}\theta}{2\,\mathsf{M}\,\mathbf{r}_{0}}\right)\right]\sin^{2}\theta \\ \mathbf{g}_{t\phi} &= -\frac{2\mathsf{M}\mathbf{r}\mathsf{A}\sin^{2}\theta}{\Sigma} \\ \mathbf{\Delta}_{\beta\gamma} &= \frac{(\mathbf{r} - \mathbf{r}_{0})\left[\Delta - 2\mathsf{M}^{2}(\beta - \gamma + \frac{\mathbf{r}_{0}}{\mathsf{M}}) + \mathbf{r}_{0}(\mathbf{r} + \mathbf{r}_{0})\right]}{\mathbf{r}} \end{split}$$

•	tell apart horizon location and asymptotic mass	r ₀ M
•	tell apart horizon spin	а

J

 $eta \ , \ \gamma$

- tell apart **horizon spin** and **asymptotic angular momentum**
- probe leading **PPN** asymptotic corrections

•

$$\Xi = (\mathsf{r_0},\mathsf{M},\mathsf{J},\beta,\gamma,\mathsf{a},\mathsf{a_{01}})$$

$$g_{tt} = -\frac{\left(\Delta_{\beta\gamma} + \frac{r_0^3(r-r_0)}{r^2} a_{01}\right) \sin^2 \theta - g_{t\phi}^2}{g_{\phi\phi}}$$
$$g_{rr} = \frac{\sum \left(1 - \frac{(1-\gamma)M}{r}\right)^2}{\left(\Delta_{\beta\gamma} + \frac{r_0^3(r-r_0)}{r^2} a_{01}\right)}$$
$$g_{\theta\theta} = \Sigma = r^2 + A^2 \cos^2 \theta$$

$$g_{\phi\phi} = \left[a^{2} + r^{2} + \frac{2Mra^{2}}{\Sigma} \left(\frac{A}{a} - \frac{(a^{2} + r_{0}^{2})\cos^{2}\theta}{2Mr_{0}}\right)\right] \sin^{2}\theta$$
$$g_{t\phi} = -\frac{2MrA\sin^{2}\theta}{\Sigma}$$
$$\Delta_{\beta\gamma} = \frac{(r - r_{0})\left[\Delta - 2M^{2}(\beta - \gamma + \frac{r_{0}}{M}) + r_{0}(r + r_{0})\right]}{r}$$

tell apart horizon location	r ₀
and asymptotic mass	M
tell apart horizon spin	a
and asymptotic angular momentum	J
probe leading PPN asymptotic corrections	eta ,
probe further near-horizon corrections such as	a ₀₁

$$\Xi = (\mathsf{r_0},\mathsf{M},\mathsf{J},\beta,\gamma,\mathsf{a},\mathsf{a_{01}})$$

$$g_{tt} = -\frac{\left(\Delta_{\beta\gamma} + \frac{r_0^3(r-r_0)}{r^2} a_{01}\right) \sin^2 \theta - g_{t\alpha}^2}{g_{\phi\phi}}$$
$$g_{rr} = \frac{\sum \left(1 - \frac{(1-\gamma)M}{r}\right)^2}{\left(\Delta_{\beta\gamma} + \frac{r_0^3(r-r_0)}{r^2} a_{01}\right)}$$
$$g_{\theta\theta} = \Sigma = r^2 + A^2 \cos^2 \theta$$
$$g_{\phi\phi} = \left[a^2 + r^2 + \frac{2Mra^2}{\pi}\left(\frac{A}{r} - \frac{(a^2 + r_0^2)}{r^2}\right)\right]$$

$$g_{\phi\phi} = \left[a^{2} + r^{2} + \frac{2Mra^{2}}{\Sigma} \left(\frac{A}{a} - \frac{(a^{2} + r_{0}^{2})\cos^{2}\theta}{2Mr_{0}}\right)\right]\sin^{2}\theta$$
$$g_{t\phi} = -\frac{2MrA\sin^{2}\theta}{\Sigma}$$
$$\Delta_{\beta\gamma} = \frac{(r - r_{0})\left[\Delta - 2M^{2}(\beta - \gamma + \frac{r_{0}}{M}) + r_{0}(r + r_{0})\right]}{r}$$

•	tell apart horizon location	r ₀
	and asymptotic mass	Ň

а

 a_{01}

 $eta \ , \ \gamma$

- tell apart horizon spin and asymptotic angular momentum
- probe leading **PPN** asymptotic corrections
- probe further near-horizon corrections such as

have to deal with large parameter spaces

$$\Xi = (\mathsf{r_0},\mathsf{M},\mathsf{J},\beta,\gamma,\mathsf{a},\mathsf{a_{01}})$$

$$g_{tt} = -\frac{\left(\Delta_{\beta\gamma} + \frac{r_0^3(r-r_0)}{r^2} a_{01}\right) \sin^2 \theta - g_{t\phi}^2}{g_{\phi\phi}}$$

$$g_{rr} = \frac{\sum \left(1 - \frac{(1-\gamma)M}{r}\right)^2}{\left(\Delta_{\beta\gamma} + \frac{r_0^3(r-r_0)}{r^2} a_{01}\right)}$$

$$g_{\theta\theta} = \Sigma = r^2 + A^2 \cos^2 \theta$$

$$g_{\phi\phi} = \left[a^2 + r^2 + \frac{2Mra^2}{\Sigma} \left(\frac{A}{a} - \frac{(a^2 + r_0^2)\cos^2 \theta}{2Mr_0}\right)\right] \sin^2 \theta$$

$$g_{t\phi} = -\frac{2MrA\sin^2 \theta}{\pi}$$

$$g_{t\phi} = -\frac{2MrA\sin^2\theta}{\Sigma}$$
$$\Delta_{\beta\gamma} = \frac{(r - r_0)\left[\Delta - 2M^2(\beta - \gamma + \frac{r_0}{M}) + r_0(r + r_0)\right]}{r}$$

•	tell apart horizon location and asymptotic mass	r ₀ M
•	tell apart horizon spin	а

- tell apart **norizon spin** and **asymptotic angular momentum**
- probe leading **PPN** asymptotic corrections
- probe further near-horizon corrections such as
 a₀₁

have to deal with large parameter spaces

... require an efficient tool.

J

 $eta \ , \ \gamma$

Part III: Lensing-band constraints





geometry

Credit: CfA Harvard & Smithsonian and Vanderbilt University



geometry



Credit: M. Johnson et. Al, Sci.Adv. 6 (2020)

Broderick et. Al, ApJ 935 (2022) Tiede et.Al, Galaxies 10, 111 (2022) geometry

need for a fast & astrophysics-independent way to exclude geometries



geometry

need for a fast & astrophysics-independent way to exclude geometries

Tiede et.Al, Galaxies 10, 111 (2022)





observation



Broderick et. Al ApJ 935 (2022) 61 We exclude spacetimes for which an observed VLBI feature cannot arise from geodesics that traversed the equatorial plane more than once Cárdenas-Avendaño, Held, 2312.06590







Cárdenas-Avendaño, Held, 2312.06590



10

10



- projected constraint on the mass (from photon-ring size) see, e.g., EHT M87* paper I
- correlation between mass and spin Broderick et. Al, AJ 935, 61 (2022), AJ 927, 6 (2022)

Cárdenas-Avendaño, Held, 2312.06590



- projected constraint on the mass (from photon-ring size) see, e.g., EHT M87* paper I
- correlation between mass and spin Broderick et. Al, AJ 935, 61 (2022), AJ 927, 6 (2022)

... recover previous work.

7-parameter family of deviations

 $\Xi = (\mathsf{r}_0, \mathsf{M}, \mathsf{J}, \beta, \gamma, \mathsf{a}, \mathsf{a}_{01})$

- horizon location: r₀
- asymptotic mass: M
- horizon spin: a
- angular momentum: J
- leading PPN corrections β , γ
- tower of strong-gravity a₀₁ parameters



