Gravitational waves as probes of black hole physics and beyond Anna Chrysostomou





Gravitational waves as probes of black hole physics and beyond

Anna Chrysostomou





« quasinormal modes » dominate post-merger signal

Gravitational waves as probes of black hole physics and beyond

Anna Chrysostomou

black hole spectroscopy





Anna Chrysostomou

« quasinormal modes » dominate post-merger signal « quasinormal modes » hint at behaviour beyond horizons

Gravitational waves as probes of black hole physics and beyond

charged + asymptotically de Sitter (Λ > 0)



Initiative Physique des Infinis Alliance Sorbonne Université



What can we learn from observing gravitational waves?

Types of gravitational wave sources



Types of gravitational wave sources





e.g. first order phase transition: spontaneous symmetry breaking from a symmetric phase (false vac.) to a broken phase (true vac.) as universe cools. Bubble nucleation generates GWs through the collision & merging of expanding bubbles + resultant sound waves propagating through primordial plasma





Types of gravitational wave sources



Types of gravitational wave sources



Black hole quasinormal modes: the basics

Stationary, neutral, spherically-symmetric black hole

$$g_{\mu\nu}dx^{\mu}dx^{\nu} = -f(r)dt^{2} + f(r)^{-1}dr^{2} + r^{2}\left(d\theta^{2} + \sin^{2}\theta d\phi^{2}\right)$$

Einstein field equations

$$R_{\mu\nu} - \frac{1}{2}g_{\mu\nu}R + \Lambda g_{\mu\nu} = \underline{16}\pi T_{\mu\nu}$$

for *flat space-time*, in vacuum

The "no-hair" conjecture

$$f(r) = 1 - \frac{2N}{r}$$

event horizon: $r_+ = 2M$ length scale: $M = Gm_{BH}c^{-2}$ (G = c = 1)

Black hole perturbation theory

$$g_{\mu\nu} \rightarrow g'_{\mu\nu} = g_{\mu\nu} + h_{\mu\nu} \quad (g_{\mu\nu} \gg h_{\mu\nu})$$

 $[m_{BH}] = M$

Stationary, neutral, spherically-symmetric black hole

$$g_{\mu\nu}dx^{\mu}dx^{\nu} = -f(r)dt^2 + f(r)^{-1}dr^2 + r^2\left(d\theta^2 + \sin^2\theta d\phi^2\right)$$



Black hole perturbation theory

$$g_{\mu\nu} \rightarrow g'_{\mu\nu} = g_{\mu\nu} + h_{\mu\nu} \quad (g_{\mu\nu} \gg h_{\mu\nu})$$

 $[G] = M^{-1}L^3T^{-2}, [c] = LT^{-1}$

 $[m_{BH}] = M$

Black hole quasinormal modes

Quasinormal mode (QNM)

$$\Psi(x^{\mu}) = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \sum_{\ell,m} \frac{\psi_{sn\ell}(r)}{r} e^{-i\omega t} Y_{\ell m}(\theta,\phi)$$

s: spin of perturbing field *m*: azimuthal number for spherical harmonic decomposition in θ , ϕ ℓ : angular/multipolar number for spherical harmonic decomposition in θ , ϕ *n*: overtone number labels ω by a monotonically increasing $|\Im m\{\omega\}|$

Quasinormal frequency (QNF)

 $\omega_{sn\ell} = \omega_R - i\omega_I$

 $\begin{aligned} &\Re e\{\omega\}: \text{physical oscillation frequency} & \to & \Re e\{\omega\} \propto \ell \\ &\Im m\{\omega\}: \text{damping} \to \text{dissipative, "quasi"} & \to & \lim_{\ell \to \infty} |\Im m\{\omega\}| = constant \end{aligned}$

Black hole wave equation

$$\frac{d^2}{dr_*^2}\varphi + \left[\omega^2 - V(r)\right]\varphi = 0 , \quad \frac{dr}{dr_*} = f(r)$$

e.g.
$$V_s(r) = f(r) \left[\frac{\ell(\ell+1)}{r^2} + \frac{f'(r)}{r} \left(1 - s^2 \right) \right]$$
, $s = 0, 1, 2$

Subjected to QNM boundary conditions:

purely ingoing:
$$\varphi(r) \sim e^{-i\omega r}$$
 $r \to r_+$
purely outgoing: $\varphi(r) \sim e^{+i\omega r}$ $r \to +\infty$

Waves escape domain of study at the boundaries \Rightarrow dissipative

Black hole quasinormal excitation factors: identifying modes in the superposition

Higher harmonics and overtones





first 10 overtones for s = 0 QNFs for increasing n

a multimodal analysis of the GW150914 data using PYRING, see Carullo et al.

Higher harmonics and overtones

"the *fundamental* $(\ell, m, n) = (2, 2, 0)$ *mode* dominates ringdown"



a multimodal analysis of the GW150914 data using pyRing, see Carullo et al.

first 10 overtones for s = 0 QNFs for increasing n

In the GW context, strain is a function of the « excitation coefficient »

Oshita, Phys. Rev. D 104 (2021)

$$h_+ + ih_{\times} = \sum_{\ell m n} C_{\ell n} Y_{\ell m}(\theta, \phi) \frac{\psi_{\ell n}}{r} e^{-i\omega_{\ell n} t},$$

which is a product of a source factor (initial data) × an independent « quasinormal excitation factor »

Formally, we model the QNM contribution to the black hole response through a Green's function analysis. This requires explicit expressions for the wavefunction, evaluated at the QNF.

> S. Detweiler, Proc. R. Soc. A 352 (1977) *E. W. Leaver, Phys. Rev. D* 34 (1986) N. Andersson, Phys. Rev. D 51 (1995)

A scattering problem



We require two linearly-independent solutions,

at the horizon:

$$\psi_{r_{+}} \sim \begin{cases} e^{-i\omega r_{\star}} & r_{\star} \to -\infty \\ A_{\ell\omega}^{-} e^{-i\omega r_{\star}} + A_{\ell\omega}^{+} e^{+i\omega r_{\star}} & r_{\star} \to +\infty \end{cases}$$

at spatial infinity:

$$\psi_{\infty} \sim e^{+i\omega r_{\star}} \qquad r_{\star} \to +\infty$$

$$W(\ell,\omega) = \psi_{r_{+}} \frac{d\psi_{\infty}}{dr_{\star}} - \psi_{\infty} \frac{d\psi_{r_{+}}}{dr_{\star}} = 2i\omega A_{\ell\omega}^{-}$$

$$\mathcal{B}_{\ell n} \equiv \left[\frac{A_{\ell \omega}^{+}}{2\omega} \left(\frac{\partial A_{\ell \omega}^{-}}{\partial \omega}\right)^{-1}\right]_{\omega = \omega_{\ell n}}$$

Challenges:

- ★ Non-Hermitian Operator: complex eigenvalues; QNMs do not form a complete set of eigenfunctions
- ★ Boundary conditions: dissipative system requiring semi-classical/ numerical treatment
- ★ Spectral instability: highly sensitive
 small perturbations alter, even
 destabilise QNM spectrum

Challenges:

★ Non-Hermitian Operator: complex eigenvalues; QNMs do not form a complete set of eigenfunctions

★ Boundary conditions: dissipative system requiring semi-classical/ numerical treatment

★ Spectral instability: highly sensitive
 - small perturbations alter, even
 destabilise QNM spectrum

Dolan-Ottewill multipolar expansion method

Class. Quant. Grav. 26 (2009), Phys. Rev. D 84 (2011)

A new computation method for BH QNMs through a novel ansatz based on

null geodesics + expansion of the QNF in inverse powers of $L = \ell + 1/2$

$$\Phi(r) = e^{i\omega z(r_*)}v(r) , \quad \omega = \sum_{k=-1}^{\infty} \omega_k L^{-k}$$

- ★ iterative procedure best performed in the eikonal limit
- * more efficient means of calculating detectable QNMs?
- ★ can extend to compute QNM wavefunctions [♦ rare find!]



Managing breakdowns in the DO method: QNM solutions

$$V(r) = f(r) \left[\frac{\ell(\ell+1)}{r^2} + \frac{f'(r)}{r} \right]$$

$$r_* < r_*^{peak}$$

$$r_* < r_*^{peak}$$

$$r_* < r_*^{peak}$$

$$r_* < r_*^{peak}$$

$$r_* > r_*^{peak}$$

$$V(r) = f(r) \left[\frac{\ell(\ell+1)}{r^2} + \frac{f'(r)}{r} \right]$$



Iyer and Will, Phys. Rev. D 35, 3621 (1987).

Managing breakdowns: QNM solutions



Managing breakdowns: QNM solutions



Managing breakdowns: QNM solutions



Recall: (i) the QNEF definition

$${\cal B}_{\ell n}\equiv \left[rac{A_{\ell \omega}^+}{2\omega}\left(rac{\partial A_{\ell \omega}^-}{\partial \omega}
ight)^{-1}
ight]_{\omega=\omega_{\ell n}}$$

(ii) the boundary conditions at the event horizon

Schwarzschild QNEFs for various ℓ and increasing *n*



Schwarzschild QNEFs for n = 0 and increasing ℓ



Black hole quasinormal frequencies: identifying violations in cosmic censorship

Stationary, neutral, spherically-symmetric black hole

$$g_{\mu\nu}dx^{\mu}dx^{\nu} = -f(r)dt^2 + f(r)^{-1}dr^2 + r^2\left(d\theta^2 + \sin^2\theta d\phi^2\right)$$



$$R_{\mu\nu} - \frac{1}{2}g_{\mu\nu}R + \Lambda g_{\mu\nu}$$

= $16\pi \left[F_{\mu\rho}F_{\nu}^{\ \rho} - \frac{1}{4}g_{\mu\nu}F_{\rho\sigma}F^{\rho\sigma}\right]$
 $\nabla^{\nu}F_{\mu\nu} = 0, \nabla_{[\mu}F_{\nu\rho]=0}$

in de Sitter space-time

Black hole perturbation theory

$$g_{\mu\nu} \rightarrow g'_{\mu\nu} = g_{\mu\nu} + h_{\mu\nu} \quad (g_{\mu\nu} \gg h_{\mu\nu})$$

The "no-hair" conjecture

$$f(r) = 1 - \frac{2M}{r} + \frac{Q^2}{r^2} - \frac{r^2}{L_{dS}^2}$$

horizons: $r_-, r_+, r_c; r_0$ length scale: $M = Gm_{BH}c^{-2}$

$$M = Gm_{BH}c^{-2}$$
$$Q = G^{1/2}q_{BH}c^{-2}$$
$$L_{dS} = (3/\Lambda)^{1/2} = 1$$

$$r_{\pm} \neq M^2 \pm \sqrt{M^2 - Q^2}$$

Stationary, neutral, spherically-symmetric black hole $g_{\mu\nu}dx^{\mu}dx^{\nu} = -f(r)dt^{2} + f(r)^{-1}dr^{2} + r^{2}\left(d\theta^{2} + \sin^{2}\theta d\phi^{2}\right)$ $\begin{array}{c|c} r_{-} \leq r_{+} \leq r_{c} \\ \hline \\ f(r) \\ f(r) \\ r = r_{-} \ modify \ g \ non-uniquely \\ Loss \ in \ determinism \ threatens \ GR \end{array}$ The "no-hair" o Einstein-Maxwell field equations $R_{\mu\nu} - \frac{1}{2}g_{\mu\nu}R + \Lambda g_{\mu\nu}$ = $16\pi \left[F_{\mu\rho}F_{\nu}^{\ \rho} - \frac{1}{4}g_{\mu\nu}F_{\rho\sigma}F^{\rho\sigma}\right]$ $\nabla^{\nu}F_{\mu\nu} = 0, \nabla_{[\mu}F_{\nu\rho]=0}$ horizons: $r_{-}, r_{+}, r_{c}; r_{0}$ length scale: $M = Gm_{BH}c^{-2}$ *in de Sitter space-time* $Q = G^{1/2} q_{BH} c^{-2}$ $L_{dS} = (3/\Lambda)^{1/2} = 1$ Black hole perturbation theory $r_{\pm} \neq M^2 \pm \sqrt{M^2 - Q^2}$ $g_{\mu\nu} \rightarrow g'_{\mu\nu} = g_{\mu\nu} + h_{\mu\nu} \quad (g_{\mu\nu} \gg h_{\mu\nu})$

For our purposes: SCC requires that the metric (*M*, *g*), as a well-defined solution to the vacuum Einstein field equations, cannot be extended past the Cauchy horizon (CH)

Different SCC versions distinguished by smoothness level required at CH

C° version (strongest SCC): generically no continuous extension exists across CH \Rightarrow singularity exists before Cauchy horizon forms

Christodoulou version: generically no weak extension (with loc. sq. integrable Christoffel sym.)

 \Rightarrow Cauchy surface is a weak null singularity

 C^2 version: generically no extension in C^2

For Einstein-Maxwell(-massless scalar) theory, with $\Lambda = 0$: C° version is false [*Christodoulou*; *Dafermos-Luk*] Christodoulou version believed to be true [*Dafermos-Rothman*; *Luk-Oh*]

Scalar field is used as a proxy for the full nonlinear solution

strength

Reissner-Nordström de Sitter black hole: blueshift vs redshift



For $\Lambda = 0$, consider two time-like observers: A: remains in $I \rightarrow$ reaches ∞ at infinite proper time B: falls into $II \rightarrow$ reaches CH at finite proper time

If observer A sends periodic (in A's time) signals to observer B, observer B will perceive them as incoming with greater frequency \Rightarrow energy of an oscillating Φ entering the black hole will increase infinitely as it approaches $r = r_{-}$

In GR, infinite energy \Rightarrow curvature divergence "Blueshift instability" rescues SCC [Penrose, 1970s]

For $\Lambda > 0$, perturbations decay rapidly (exponentially) Is there enough energy to lead to blueshift instability?

Reissner-Nordström de Sitter black hole: blueshift vs redshift



Two competing behaviours ($\Lambda > 0 \Rightarrow \exp vs \exp$): Asymptotic decay at r_+ , $\psi \sim e^{\Im m \{\omega_{n=0}\}t}$ [quasinormal modes] Blueshift at r_- , $\psi \sim e^{\kappa_- t}$

A blueshift amplification phenomenon characterises the dynamics of infalling fields as they accumulate along the inner Cauchy horizon

$$-\frac{\Im m\{\omega_{n=0}\}}{|\kappa_{-}|} < \frac{1}{2} \quad [Hints \& Vasy]$$

where $\Im m\{\omega\} < 0$ *is a necessary condition for black hole stability*

SCC violations in RNdS



SCC violations in RNdS



Thanks!

Any questions?

Or write to me via chrysostomou@lpthe.jussieu.fr

Vue du Panthéon à Paris Jean-Baptiste-Camille Corot (1796-1875)



To reach beyond « visible » cosmological history of the universe,

Black hole wave equation:

$$\frac{d^2}{dr_*^2}\varphi + \left[\left(\omega - \frac{qQ}{r}\right)^2 - V(r)\right]\varphi = 0, \quad \frac{dr}{dr_*} = f(r)$$

e.g.
$$V_{s=0} = f(r) \left(\frac{\ell(\ell+1)}{r^2} + \frac{f'(r)}{r} + \mu^2 \right)$$

 $\mu = \frac{m_s}{\hbar}, \ q \propto e \ ([\mu] = L^{-1}, \ [q] = 1)$

Subjected to QNM boundary conditions:

purely ingoing:
$$\varphi(r) \sim e^{-i\left(\omega - \frac{qQ}{r_+}\right)r}$$
 $r \to r_+$
purely outgoing: $\varphi(r) \sim e^{+i\left(\omega - \frac{qQ}{r_c}\right)r}$ $r \to r_c$

Waves escape domain of study at the boundaries \Rightarrow dissipative

Reissner-Nordström de Sitter black hole



Schwarzschild modes (I) & de Sitter modes (II):

(*I.i*) photon-sphere modes: beneath line M = Q, approaching NUlarge $\Im m\{\omega\}$, $\Re e\{\omega\} \sim \mathcal{O}(0.01)$ for Q < 0.1 $\Im m\{\omega_{PS}\} \approx -i\left(n + \frac{1}{2}\right)\kappa_{+}$ on NU(*I.ii*) near-extremal modes: branch $OU(r_{-} \sim r_{+})$ $\omega_{NE} \approx -i(\ell + n + 1)\kappa_{-} = -i(\ell + n + 1)\kappa_{+};$ (*II*) dS modes: along branch $OU(\kappa_{c} \sim 1/L_{dS})$ $\omega_{dS_{n=0}} \approx -i\ell\kappa_{c}, \quad \omega_{dS_{n\neq 0}} \approx -i(\ell + n + 1)\kappa_{c};$

DO method: details

Components of the ansatz

$$v(r) = \exp\left\{\sum_{k=0}^{\infty} S_k(r) L^{-k}\right\}, \quad z(r_*) = \int^{r_*} \rho(r) dr_* = \int^{r_*} b_c k_c(r) dr_*$$

$$r_{c} = \frac{2f(r)}{\partial_{r}f(r)}\Big|_{r=r_{c}}, \quad b_{c} = \sqrt{\frac{r^{2}}{f(r)}}\Big|_{r=r_{c}}, \quad k_{c}(r)^{2} = \frac{1}{b^{2}} - \frac{f(r)}{r^{2}}$$

We generalise the consequent ODE

$$f(r)\frac{d}{dr}\left(f(r)\frac{dv}{dr}\right) + 2i\omega\rho(r)\frac{dv}{dr} + \left[i\omega f(r)\frac{d\rho}{dr} + (1-\rho(r)^2)\omega^2 - V(r)\right]v(r) = 0$$

We solve iteratively for ω_k and $S'_k(r)$ and sub into ω

DO method: details

Components of the ansatz

$$r_c = 3$$
, $b_c = \sqrt{27} \Rightarrow \rho(r) = \left(1 - \frac{3}{r}\right)\sqrt{1 + \frac{6}{r}}$

For a scalar field s = 0, N = n + 1/2, and $L = \ell + 1/2$,

$$\begin{split} \sqrt{27}\omega_{\ell n} &= L - iN + \left[\frac{1}{3} - \frac{5N^2}{36} - \frac{15}{432}\right]L^{-1} - iN\left[\frac{1}{9} + \frac{235N^2}{3888} - \frac{1415}{15552}\right]L^{-2} \\ &+ \left[-\frac{1}{27} + \frac{204N^2 + 211}{3888} + \frac{854160N^4 - 1664760N^2 - 776939}{40310784}\right]L^{-3} \\ &+ iN\left[\frac{1}{27} + \frac{1100N^2 - 2719}{46656} + \frac{11273136N^4 - 52753800N^2 + 66480535}{2902376448}\right] \end{split}$$

+...

For
$$L = \sqrt{\ell(\ell+1)}$$
, as a series expansion $\omega = \sum_{k=-1} \omega_k L^{-k}$
 $\omega_k = \sqrt{V(r_*^{max}) - 2iU}$, $U \equiv U(V^{(2)}, V^{(3)}, V^{(4)}, V^{(5)}, V^{(6)})$
 $V^j = \frac{d^j V(r_*^{max})}{dr^j} = f(r) \frac{d}{dr} \left[f(r) \frac{d}{dr} \left[\dots \left[f(r) \frac{dV(r)}{dr} \right] \dots \right] \right]_{r \to r_*^{max}}$
 $r_*^{max} \approx r_0 + r_1 L^{-2} + \dots$,
 $V(r_*^{max}) \approx V_0 + V_1 L^{-2} + \dots$

 $q \neq 0 \Rightarrow$ two sets of solutions:

 ω_+ (black-hole family) & ω_c (cosmological-horizon family) For a fixed q, $|\Re e\{\omega_+\}| < |\Re e\{\omega_c\}| & |\Im m\{\omega_+\}| < |\Im m\{\omega_c\}|$