



1

Development of an unbiased shear estimator measured on galaxies

Enya Van den Abeele, Pierre Astier

LSST France - CC IN2P3 Lyon

December 2023

Context

Weak lensing (cosmic shear) : statistical detection

Why do we use cosmic shear?

 \rightarrow Both matter and expansion sensibility

 \rightarrow Powerful tool to understand dark energy



Context

Weak lensing (cosmic shear) : statistical detection

Why do we use cosmic shear ?

 \rightarrow Both matter and expansion sensibility

 \rightarrow Powerful tool to understand dark energy



Context

Weak lensing (cosmic shear) : statistical detection

Why do we use cosmic shear?

- \rightarrow Both matter and expansion sensibility
- → Powerful tool to understand **dark energy**

Challenge of the next decade : precision cosmology

 \rightarrow Will be possible with LSST images, but complex measurement : associated biases, one source being the **shear estimator**

<u>My goal</u> : Development of an unbiased cosmic shear estimator measured on galaxy shapes





Method : Formalism

Distortion of an image described by matrix : $\mathscr{A}(\theta)$

$$0) = \begin{pmatrix} 1 - \kappa - \gamma_1 & -\gamma_2 \\ -\gamma_2 & 1 - \kappa + \gamma_1 \end{pmatrix}$$

Shear components : $\gamma \equiv \gamma_1 + i\gamma_2 = |\gamma|e^{2i\phi}$

Weak lensing:
$$|\gamma| \ll \kappa \ll 1$$

reduced shear: $g_i = \frac{\gamma_i}{1-\kappa}$



We use the seconds moments to measure the shape of the galaxy

We use the seconds moments to measure the shape of the galaxy

$$M = \int X X^T W(X) I(X) dX^2$$

$$\stackrel{\text{Pixel}}{\longrightarrow} \quad \text{Weight function} \quad I = I_0 \circledast \psi$$

Ellipticity second moment estimator (linear combination of seconds moments)

$$e = \begin{pmatrix} e_1 \\ e_2 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} M_{xx} - M_{yy} \\ 2M_{xy} \end{pmatrix}$$

Ellipticity from seconds moments is not sufficient to measure the shear \rightarrow **Need to calibrate**

The galaxy profile in unknown **but :** we do know how to insert shear into images !

Ellipticity from seconds moments is not sufficient to measure the shear \rightarrow **Need to calibrate**

The galaxy profile in unknown **but :** we do know how to insert shear into images !

Idea : Shear-sensitive algorithm \rightarrow see how it reacts to the introduction of small shear variations

$$M(S) = \int [(YY^TW(Y)) \circledast \psi_{-}](X) I_0(SX) dX^2$$

Method used in
Method used

Ellipticity from seconds moments is not sufficient to measure the shear \rightarrow **Need to calibrate**

The galaxy profile in unknown **but :** we do know how to insert shear into images !

Idea : Shear-sensitive algorithm \rightarrow see how it reacts to the introduction of small shear variations

$$M(S) = \int [(YY^TW(Y)) \circledast \psi_-](X) I_0(SX) dX^2$$

Method used in
Metacalibration
arXiv:1702.02601
No shear applied to the original image !

$$M(S) = \int F(S^{-1}X)I_0(X) dX^2$$

$$M(S) = \int F(Sk)I_0(k) dk^2$$

$$= \int \frac{F(Sk)}{\tilde{\psi^*}} \tilde{\psi^*}I_0(k) dk^2$$

$$= \int G(S, X)[\psi \circledast I_0] dX^2$$

$$\implies = \int G(S, X)I(X) dX^2$$

Shear dependency : inserting small shear variations, calculating the **numerical derivative**

$$\frac{dM}{d\gamma} = \int \frac{dG(S(\gamma), X)}{d\gamma} I(X) \, dX^2$$

$$g_{1} = \pm \varepsilon ; g_{2} = 0 \implies \frac{\partial M}{\partial g_{1}} = \frac{SM_{1+} - SM_{1-}}{2\epsilon}$$
$$g_{1} = 0 ; g_{2} = \pm \varepsilon \implies \frac{\partial M}{\partial g_{2}} = \frac{SM_{2+} - SM_{2-}}{2\epsilon}$$

Shear dependency : inserting small shear variations, calculating the **numerical derivative** Self calibration factor (linear combination of seconds moments derivatives with respect to the shear)

 $\frac{\partial g_1}{\partial e_2}$

$$\frac{dM}{d\gamma} = \int \frac{dG(S(\gamma), X)}{d\gamma} I(X) dX^{2} \qquad \mathbf{R} = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{\partial e_{1}}{\partial g_{1}} & \frac{\partial e_{2}}{\partial g_{1}} \\ \frac{\partial e_{1}}{\partial g_{2}} & \frac{\partial e_{2}}{\partial g_{2}} \end{pmatrix}$$

$$g_{1} = \pm \varepsilon; g_{2} = 0 \implies \frac{\partial M}{\partial g_{1}} = \frac{SM_{1+} - SM_{1-}}{2\epsilon} \qquad = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{\partial M_{xx}}{\partial g_{1}} - \frac{\partial M_{yy}}{\partial g_{1}} & \frac{2\partial M_{yy}}{\partial g_{2}} \\ \frac{\partial M_{xx}}{\partial g_{2}} - \frac{\partial M_{yy}}{\partial g_{2}} & \frac{2\partial M_{yy}}{\partial g_{2}} \end{pmatrix}$$

7

 $2\partial M_{xy}$

 $\frac{\partial g_1}{2\partial M_{xy}}$

Method : Shear calibration

$$e = \begin{pmatrix} e_1 \\ e_2 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} M_{xx} - M_{yy} \\ 2M_{xy} \end{pmatrix}$$

$$\mathbf{R} = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{\partial e_1}{\partial g_1} & \frac{\partial e_2}{\partial g_1} \\ \frac{\partial e_1}{\partial g_2} & \frac{\partial e_2}{\partial g_2} \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{\partial M_{xx}}{\partial g_1} - \frac{\partial M_{yy}}{\partial g_1} & \frac{2\partial M_{xy}}{\partial g_2} \\ \frac{\partial M_{xx}}{\partial g_2} - \frac{\partial M_{yy}}{\partial g_2} & \frac{2\partial M_{xy}}{\partial g_2} \end{pmatrix}$$
(LSST : we aim to have biases less than ‰)

Advantages of this method :

Advantages of this method :

• Calculations are based on second moments, rather than maximum likelihood, so we don't have to make any assumption about the galaxy profile.

Advantages of this method :

- Calculations are based on second moments, rather than maximum likelihood, so we don't have to make any assumption about the galaxy profile.
- The *F* function is more extensive than the object image *I*₀, and therefore better resolved, it is therefore better to apply shear distortion on it.

Application of shear variations ($\pm \epsilon$) to calculate derivatives : distortion of the coordinate system (with *S* matrix), then interpolation of the image (*F* function) onto the new grid.



Application of shear variations ($\pm \epsilon$) to calculate derivatives : distortion of the coordinate system (with *S* matrix), then interpolation of the image (*F* function) onto the new grid.





10

Application of shear variations ($\pm \epsilon$) to calculate derivatives : distortion of the coordinate system (with *S* matrix), then interpolation of the image (*F* function) onto the new grid.





Application of shear variations $(\pm \epsilon)$ to calculate derivatives : distortion of the coordinate system (with S matrix), then interpolation of the image (*F* function) onto the new grid.

grid distortion

interpolation



Application of shear variations ($\pm \epsilon$) to calculate derivatives : distortion of the coordinate system (with *S* matrix), then interpolation of the image (*F* function) onto the new grid.

Sampling :

$$I = I_c \otimes \Pi \iff M = M_c + M_{pix}$$
$$M = \int XX^T I(X) d^2 X + \frac{JJ^T}{12}$$



with

- J : the Jacobian involved in the affine transformation of coordinates (pixel ↔ physical)

- **s** : the image pixel scale (arcsec/pixel)

 $J = \left(\begin{array}{cc} s & 0\\ 0 & s \end{array}\right)$

As we measure the *SM* matrices on a distorted pixels grid, **we should subtract a** *distorted* **pixels second moments matrix** *Mpix* to recover the real object second moments.

New second moments formalism :

$$M(s,\epsilon) \propto \gamma + \alpha \epsilon + \alpha' \epsilon^2 + \beta s^2 + \beta' s^4 + \delta s^2 \epsilon + \delta' s^4 \epsilon$$

theoretical second moment

sampling correction

sampling x shear correction

As we measure the *SM* matrices on a distorted pixels grid, **we should subtract a** *distorted* **pixels second moments matrix** *Mpix* to recover the real object second moments.

New second moments formalism :

$$M(s,\epsilon) \propto \gamma + \alpha \epsilon + \alpha' \epsilon^2 + \beta s^2 + \beta' s^4 + \delta s^2 \epsilon + \delta' s^4 \epsilon$$

theoretical second moment

sampling correction

sampling x shear correction

Bias introduced by a cross-effect between shear and sampling

As we measure the *SM* matrices on a distorted pixels grid, **we should subtract a** *distorted* **pixels second moments matrix** *Mpix* to recover the real object second moments.

New second moments formalism :

influence M_{xx} and M_{yy} , which are subtracted in **e** and **R**)

$$M(s,\epsilon) \propto \gamma + \alpha \epsilon + \alpha' \epsilon^{2} + \beta s^{2} + \beta' s^{4} + \delta s^{2} \epsilon + \delta' s^{4} \epsilon$$
theoretical second moment sampling correction sampling correction sampling correction will cancel (they only ϵ between

12

shear and sampling

No big impact of the galaxy profile on the parameters estimation, but highly related to the size of the galaxy.

 \rightarrow Relation between δ' and galaxy second moment (Gaussian profile)



No big impact of the galaxy profile on the parameters estimation, but highly related to the size of the galaxy.

 \rightarrow Relation between δ' and galaxy second moment (Gaussian profile)



The result of the fit works for any galaxy profile (including realistic profiles from the COSMOS catalog), **but not when the PSF profile is different**

 \rightarrow **BUT** this is not a problem : the PSF profile is sufficiently well known

Results : Elliptical gaussians galaxies

Comparison : Mean over elliptical galaxies ($\langle g \rangle = \langle R \rangle^{-1} \langle e \rangle$)



Upper panel : absolute difference between applied shear and estimated shear

Lower panel : relative difference

Estimation performed over 20 random shear values and averaging over 20 pairs of random (and opposite) intrinsic ellipticities.

Results : Realistic galaxy profile (COSMOS catalog)

Comparison : Mean over random rotations applied to the galaxy





15

Analytical calculation of position variance :

$$\sigma(x_0)^2 = K^2 \sigma_{noise}^2 \frac{M_W}{2} \sum_i W_i^2$$

with :

$$(X - X_0)(X - X_0)^T$$
$$M = \int X X^T W(X) I(X) \, dX^2$$

16

$(X - X_0)(X - X_0)^T$ $M = \int X X^T W(X) I(X) \, dX^2$

Results : Noisy simulations

Analytical calculation of position variance :



$(X - X_0)(X - X_0)^T$ $M = \int X X^T W(X) I(X) \, dX^2$

Results : Noisy simulations

Analytical calculation of position variance :



Analytical calculation of second moment noise bias :

$$m_{I}(I+n) = m_{I}(I) + \sum_{k} \frac{dm_{I}}{dI_{k}} n_{k} + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{kl} \frac{d^{2}m_{I}}{dI_{k}dI_{l}} n_{k} n_{l}$$

Analytical calculation of second moment noise bias :

$$m_{I}(I+n) = m_{I}(I) + \sum_{k} \frac{dm_{I}}{dI_{k}} n_{k} + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{kl} \underbrace{\frac{d^{2}m_{I}}{dI_{k}dI_{l}}} n_{k} n_{l}$$

6 correction terms, depending on :

- Position variance
- W size
- I*W size
- I*W flux
- 4th moments of W and I*W

Analytical calculation of second moment noise bias :



Thank you

Backup

Method : Theoretical prediction



Upper panel : absolute difference between applied shear and estimated shear Lower panel : relative difference **e** : ellipticity second moment estimator

R (self calibration factor) : linear combination of seconds moments derivatives with respect to the shear

$$M = \begin{pmatrix} M_{xx} & M_{xy} \\ M_{xy} & M_{yy} \end{pmatrix}$$

 $e = \begin{pmatrix} e_1 \\ e_2 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} M_{xx} - M_{yy} \\ 2M_{xy} \end{pmatrix}$

$\mathbf{R} = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{\partial e_1}{\partial g_1} & \frac{\partial e_2}{\partial g_1} \\ \frac{\partial e_1}{\partial g_2} & \frac{\partial e_2}{\partial g_2} \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{\partial M_{xx}}{\partial g_1} - \frac{\partial M_{yy}}{\partial g_1} & \frac{2\partial M_{xy}}{\partial g_1} \\ \frac{\partial M_{xx}}{\partial g_2} - \frac{\partial M_{yy}}{\partial g_2} & \frac{2\partial M_{xy}}{\partial g_2} \end{pmatrix}$

Shear estimation :

$$\langle g \rangle = \langle R \rangle^{-1} \langle e \rangle$$

(LSST : we aim to have biases less than ‰)

g1 bias estimation

$$e = \begin{pmatrix} e_1 \\ e_2 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} M_{xx} - M_{yy} \\ 2M_{xy} \end{pmatrix}$$

$$\mathbf{R} = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{\partial e_1}{\partial g_1} & \frac{\partial e_2}{\partial g_1} \\ \frac{\partial e_1}{\partial g_2} & \frac{\partial e_2}{\partial g_2} \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{\partial M_{xx}}{\partial g_1} - \frac{\partial M_{yy}}{\partial g_1} & \frac{2\partial M_{xy}}{\partial g_1} \\ \frac{\partial M_{xx}}{\partial g_2} - \frac{\partial M_{yy}}{\partial g_2} & \frac{2\partial M_{xy}}{\partial g_2} \end{pmatrix}$$

Observed gap between the derivative of e1 calculated with *polyder* and the value of R1 \rightarrow explains the bias on the estimate of g1.



Results : Simulations

Parameters :

N = 100 (image size)

Pixel scale = 0.2 arcsec/pixel (similar to LSST)

Ngal = 10 (mean over Ngal galaxies)

Ellip. Intrinsèques = [-0.3 ; 0.3] (zero in average)

Cosmic shear = [-0.02 ; 0.02] (5 or 10 values)

Simulations performed using the *Galsim* package

		PSF (FWHM = 0.8"; σ = 0.34")		
	Profils	Gaussien	Kolmogorov	Moffat (β = 3.5)
alaxies	Gaussien	$\sigma = [0.15 - 0.4]$	FWHM = [0.36 - 1.0]	FWHM = [0.35 - 1.0]
	Sersic n = 0.5	R _H = [0.18 – 0.5]	R _H = [0.18 – 0.48]	R _H = [0.18 – 0.5]
	Sersic n = 1.5	R _H = [0.14 – 0.54]	R _H = [0.14 – 0.52]	R _H = [0.14 – 0.52]

Results : Trace ratio

Trace Ratio :
$$TR = \frac{Tr(M_{image})}{Tr(M_{PSF})}$$

DES Y1 : From TR = 1.5 (and below), shear estimation becomes poor.

To test different galaxy and PSF profiles (Gaussian, Moffat, Sersic...), we look at certain key TR values (between 1.2 and 2.5), to test the limits of the estimator.

- We set the FWHM of the PSF to a given value (0.8"), then vary the FWHM of the galaxy to achieve the desired TR values.
- The FWHM of the weight W is set between 20 and 30% higher than the FWHM of the PSF (if FWHM(PSF) = 0.8", then FWHM(W) = 1").

Shear application to seconds moments : *Metacalibration*

Image after shear application : $I(s) = P \otimes [\mathbf{s}(P^{-1} \otimes I)]$

with s the shear operator and P the atmospheric seeing + PSF + pixel response function.

To remove noise amplified by deconvolution, creation of a **dilated PSF** Γ : $\Gamma(x) = P((1+2|\gamma|)x)$ **New sheared image:** $I(s) = \Gamma \otimes [\mathbf{s} * (P^{-1} \otimes I)]$

shear distorsion

 \rightarrow This procedure introduces correlated anisotropic noise, which can lead to a systematic multiplicative bias.

Estimation method :

$$\left< \gamma \right> pprox \left< R_{\gamma} \right>^{-1} \left< e \right> pprox \left< R_{\gamma} \right>^{-1} \left< R_{\gamma} \gamma \right>.$$

$$\langle \boldsymbol{e} \rangle \approx \int d\boldsymbol{e} \frac{\partial P(\boldsymbol{e})\boldsymbol{e}}{\partial \boldsymbol{\gamma}} \Big|_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}=0} \boldsymbol{\gamma} \ d\boldsymbol{e} = \langle \boldsymbol{R}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}} \boldsymbol{\gamma} \rangle$$

$$\langle \boldsymbol{R}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}} \rangle = \int \frac{\partial P(\boldsymbol{e})\boldsymbol{e}}{\partial \boldsymbol{\gamma}} \Big|_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}=0} d\boldsymbol{e} \approx \int d\boldsymbol{e} \left(\frac{P^{+}\boldsymbol{e}_{i}^{+} - P^{-}\boldsymbol{e}_{i}^{-}}{\Delta \gamma_{j}} \right) d\boldsymbol{e}$$

$$= \frac{\langle \boldsymbol{e}_{i}^{+} \rangle - \langle \boldsymbol{e}_{i}^{-} \rangle}{\Delta \gamma_{j}}, \qquad (10)$$

Shear application to seconds moments

Theoretical second moments (after shear application) :

$$M(S) = SMS^T = A^2 \begin{pmatrix} a & b \\ c & d \end{pmatrix}$$

$$S = \underbrace{\frac{1}{\sqrt{1 - g^2}}} \begin{pmatrix} 1 + g_1 & g_2 \\ g_2 & 1 - g_1 \end{pmatrix}$$

If g1 ≠ 0 and g2 = 0 : $a = (1 + g_1)^2 M_{xx}$ $b = (1 - g_1^2) * M_{xy}$ $c = (1 - g_1^2) * M_{yx}$ $d = (1 - g_1)^2 * M_{yy}$ If $g2 \neq 0$ and g1 = 0:

$$a = M_{xx} + g_2 * (M_{xy} + Myx + g_2 * M_{yy})$$

$$b = M_{xy} + g_2 * (M_{xx} + M_{yy} + g_2 * M_{yx})$$

$$c = M_{yx} + g_2 * (M_{xx} + M_{yy} + g_2 * M_{xy})$$

$$d = M_{yy} + g_2 * (M_{xy} + Myx + g_2 * M_{xx})_{42}$$

Pixel second moment calculation

$$M_{pix} = \int_{pixel} (\vec{X} - \vec{X_c}) (\vec{X} - \vec{X_c})^T d^2 \vec{X} / \int_{pixel} d^2 \vec{X}$$

Xc : pixel center **M** : Jacobian

 $(\vec{X} - \vec{X_c}) = M(\vec{i} - \vec{i_c})$ $d^2 \vec{X} = |det(M)| d^2 \vec{i}$ change of variable

Position's variance calculation

$$f(x_0, I) = \sum (x_i - x_0) W(x_i - x_0) I_i$$

$$\frac{\partial x_0}{\partial I_i} = -\frac{\frac{\partial f}{\partial I_i}}{\frac{\partial f}{\partial x_0}} \begin{cases} \frac{\partial f}{\partial I_i} = (x_i - x_0)W_i \\ \frac{\partial f}{\partial x_0} = -\sum WI + M_W^{-1} \sum (x_i - x_0)(x_i - x_0)^T WI \\ = -F\mathbb{1} + M_W^{-1} M_P^* F \end{cases}$$

$$\frac{\partial x_0}{\partial I_i} = \frac{1}{F} [\mathbb{1} - M_W^{-1} M_P]^{-1} (x_i - x_0) W_i$$

When noise is added (ϵ):

$$\delta x_0 = \frac{\partial x_0}{\partial I_i} \epsilon_i$$
$$= K(x_i - x_0) W_i \epsilon_i$$

$$\sigma(x_0)^2 = \sum \left(\frac{\partial x_0}{\partial \epsilon_i}\right)^2 \sigma(\epsilon_i)^2$$

= $\sum \left(\frac{\partial x_0}{\partial I_i}\right)^2 \sigma_{noise}^2$
= $K^2 \sigma_{noise}^2 \sum (x_i - x_0)(x_i - x_0)^T W_i^2$
= $K^2 \sigma_{noise}^2 \frac{M_W}{2} \sum W_i^2$

Noise bias analytical calculation

$$m_{I}(I+n) = m_{I}(I) + \underbrace{\sum_{k} (\frac{dm_{I}}{dx_{0}} + \frac{dm_{I}}{dI_{k}})n_{k}}_{\mathbf{0}} + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{k} (\frac{d^{2}m_{I}}{dx_{0}^{2}} + 2\frac{d^{2}m_{I}}{dx_{0}dI_{k}} + \frac{d^{2}m_{I}}{dI_{k}^{2}})n_{k}^{2}$$

$$t1 = 2FV_x$$

$$t2 = -2(V_x M_W^{-1} m_i)$$

$$t3 = t2$$

$$t4 = -m_i Tr(V_x M_W^{-1}) + M_{4i}(M_W^{-1} V_x M_W^{-1})$$

$$t5 = -4KM_{W^2}$$

$$t6 = M_{4W^2}(KM_W^{-1})$$

4 terms

2 terms

Sersic profile



Sersic 1D, different n

