King Fits: Bounds on Light New Physics from Isotope Shifts

Fiona Kirk



axions++ 2023 28th September 2023

Outline

Introduction to King-Plots

Isotope Shifts The King-Plot Construction Bounds on New Bosons

Global Fit to King-Plot Data

Ytterbium King-Plots

Outline

Introduction to King-Plots

Isotope Shifts The King-Plot Construction Bounds on New Bosons

Global Fit to King-Plot Data

Ytterbium King-Plots

Here's an atom:



Here's an atom:





 $\Rightarrow~$ Can assume factorisation of electronic and nuclear contributions.

Can assume factorisation of electronic and nuclear contributions.

Can assume factorisation of electronic and nuclear contributions.



Can assume factorisation of electronic and nuclear contributions.



Isotope shifts:

$$\nu_i^{\mathcal{A}\mathcal{A}'} = \mathcal{K}_i \mu^{\mathcal{A}\mathcal{A}'} + \mathcal{F}_i \delta \langle r^2 \rangle^{\mathcal{A}\mathcal{A}'} + \dots$$

$$\nu_i^{\mathbf{A}\mathbf{A}'} \equiv \nu_i^{\mathbf{A}} - \nu_i^{\mathbf{A}'}$$

i: transition index AA': isotope pair index K_i, F_i, \ldots : electronic coeffs. $\mu^{AA'}, \delta \langle r^2 \rangle^{AA'}, \ldots$: nuclear coeffs. *Z*: number of protons N, N': number of neutrons in A, A'

Isotope Shifts: Mass Shift & Field Shift

$$\nu_i^{AA'} = K_i \mu^{AA'} + F_i \delta \langle r^2 \rangle^{AA'} + \dots$$

Mass Shift

Different motion of the nucleus \Rightarrow Correction to e^- kin. energy

$$\mu^{AA'} = \frac{1}{m^A} - \frac{1}{m^{A'}}$$

Field Shift

Different nucl. charge distrib. \Rightarrow Different contact interactions betw. e^- & nuclei

$$\delta \langle r^2 \rangle^{AA'} = \langle r^2 \rangle^A - \langle r^2 \rangle^{A'}$$

The King-Plot: Invert a System of Linear Equations

W. King, J. Opt. Soc. Am. 53, 638 (1963).

Idea: Trade in data for poorly known nuclear/electronic coefficients.

The King-Plot: Invert a System of Linear Equations

W. King, J. Opt. Soc. Am. 53, 638 (1963).

Idea: Trade in data for poorly known nuclear/electronic coefficients.

Measure isotope-shifts for 2 transitions:



The King-Plot: Invert a System of Linear Equations

W. King, J. Opt. Soc. Am. 53, 638 (1963).

Idea: Trade in data for poorly known nuclear/electronic coefficients.

Measure isotope-shifts for 2 Isotope shifts: transitions:



$$\nu_1^{AA'} = K_1 \mu^{AA'} + F_1 \delta \langle r^2 \rangle^{AA'}$$
$$\nu_2^{AA'} = K_2 \mu^{AA'} + F_2 \delta \langle r^2 \rangle^{AA'}$$

Eliminate charge radius variance $\delta \langle r^2 \rangle^{AA'}$

$$\tilde{\nu}_2^{\mathbf{A}\mathbf{A}'} = \mathbf{K}_{21} + \mathbf{F}_{21}\tilde{\nu}_1^{\mathbf{A}\mathbf{A}'}$$

$$\begin{split} \tilde{\nu}_i^{AA'} &\equiv \nu_i^{AA'} / \mu^{AA'} \quad \Rightarrow \text{data} \\ F_{21} &\equiv F_2 / F_1 \quad K_{21} &\equiv K_2 - F_{21} K_1 \quad \Rightarrow \text{fit} \end{split}$$



$$\tilde{\nu}_{2}^{AA''} = K_{21} + F_{21}\tilde{\nu}_{1}^{AA''}$$







...How about using King-Plots for the search for new physics? PRD 96, 093001 (2017),

DESY 17-055, FERMILAB-PUB-17-077-T, LAPTh-009/17, MIT-CTP-4898

Probing new light force-mediators by isotope shift spectroscopy

Julian C. Berengut,^{1, *} Dmitry Budker,^{2,3,4,†} Cédric Delaunay,^{5,‡} Victor V. Flambaum,^{1,§} Claudia Frugiuele,^{6,¶} Elina Fuchs,^{6, **} Christophe Grojean,^{7,8,††} Roni Harnik,^{9,‡‡} Roee Ozeri,^{10,§§} Gilad Perez,^{6,¶¶} and Yotam Soreq^{11, ***}

Search for new mediator ϕ between the nucleus and bound e^-

...How about using King-Plots for the search for new physics? PRD 96, 093001 (2017),

DESY 17-055, FERMILAB-PUB-17-077-T, LAPTh-009/17, MIT-CTP-4898

Probing new light force-mediators by isotope shift spectroscopy

Julian C. Berengut,^{1, *} Dmitry Budker,^{2,3,4,†} Cédric Delaunay,^{5,‡} Victor V. Flambaum,^{1,§} Claudia Frugiuele,^{6,¶} Elina Fuchs,^{6, **} Christophe Grojean,^{7,8,††} Roni Harnik,^{9,‡‡} Roee Ozeri,^{10,§§} Gilad Perez,^{6,¶¶} and Yotam Soreq^{11, ***}

Search for new mediator ϕ between the nucleus and bound e^-



New effective Yukawa-potential

$$V_{\phi}(r) = -\alpha_{\rm NP}(A-Z)\frac{e^{-m_{\phi}r}}{r}$$

with $\alpha_{\rm NP}=(-1)^{s}rac{y_ey_n}{4\pi}$, s=0,1,2 (spin)



New effective Yukawa-potential

$$V_{\phi}(r) = -\alpha_{\rm NP}(A-Z)\frac{e^{-m_{\phi}r}}{r}$$

with $\alpha_{\rm NP}=(-1)^{s}rac{y_ey_n}{4\pi}$, s=0,1,2 (spin)

Induces new term in the King-relation:

$$\begin{split} \tilde{\nu}_{2}^{\mathcal{A}\mathcal{A}'} &= \mathcal{K}_{21}\tilde{\mu}^{\mathcal{A}\mathcal{A}'} + \mathcal{F}_{21}\tilde{\nu}_{1}^{\mathcal{A}\mathcal{A}'} + \alpha_{\mathrm{NP}}X_{21}\tilde{\gamma}^{\mathcal{A}\mathcal{A}'} \\ X_{21} &= X_2 - \mathcal{F}_{21}X_1 \text{: NP electronic coefficient} \\ \tilde{\gamma}^{\mathcal{A}\mathcal{A}'} &\equiv (\mathcal{A} - \mathcal{A}')/\mu^{\mathcal{A}\mathcal{A}'} \text{: NP nucl. coeff.} \end{split}$$



New effective Yukawa-potential

$$V_{\phi}(r) = -\alpha_{\rm NP}(A-Z)\frac{e^{-m_{\phi}r}}{r}$$

with $\alpha_{\rm NP}=(-1)^{s}rac{y_ey_n}{4\pi}$, s=0,1,2 (spin)

Induces new term in the King-relation:

$$\begin{split} \tilde{\nu}_{2}^{AA'} &= K_{21}\tilde{\mu}^{AA'} + F_{21}\tilde{\nu}_{1}^{AA'} + \alpha_{\text{NP}}X_{21}\tilde{\gamma}^{AA'} \\ X_{21} &= X_2 - F_{21}X_1 \text{: NP electronic coefficient} \\ \tilde{\gamma}^{AA'} &\equiv (A - A')/\mu^{AA'} \text{: NP nucl. coeff.} \end{split}$$

 \Rightarrow Extract α_{NP} from fraction of volumes spanned by frequency vectors:

$$\alpha_{\rm NP} = \frac{Vol.}{Vol.|_{th,\alpha_{\rm NP}=1}} = \frac{\det\left(\vec{\nu}_1, \vec{\nu}_2, \vec{\mu}\right)}{\varepsilon_{ijk} \det\left(X_i \vec{\gamma}, \vec{\nu}_j, \vec{\nu}_k\right)}$$

{ $\vec{\nu}_i$ }: data vectors in isotope-pair space, $\vec{\mu} \equiv (1, 1, 1), X_i, \vec{\gamma}$: theory input

The "Money Plot": α_{NP} vs. m_{ϕ}

Upper bounds on α_{NP} vs. the mass of the new mediator between neutrons and bound electrons: *



- $m_{\phi} \rightarrow 0$: characteristic length scale > size of atom
- *m*_φ → ∞: King-Plots are not sensitive to contact interactions
- "Peaks" due to cancellations among electronic coefficients

*black: [PRL 115 053003], red: [PRL 125, 123003 (2020)], green: [PRL 125, 123002 (2020)], orange: [preliminary results from PTB], Be: [PRL 117 (2016) 7, 071803, PRD 95 (2017) 3, 035017]

Choose your King-Plot

Extraction of α_{NP} using the "determinant method" requires

Type of King-Plot	Isotope-Pairs	Transitions	
Generalised King-Plot:	п	n-1	[PRR 2, 043444 (2020)]

 $n \ge 3$ (else cannot search for nonlinearities)

$$\alpha_{\rm NP} = \frac{Vol.'}{Vol.'|_{\rm th,\alpha_{\rm NP}}=1} = \frac{(n-2)! \det\left(\vec{\tilde{\nu}_1},\ldots,\vec{\tilde{\nu}_{n-1}},\vec{\tilde{\mu}}\right)}{\varepsilon_{i_1,\ldots,i_{n-1}} \det\left(X_{i_1}\vec{\tilde{\gamma}},\vec{\tilde{\nu}}_{i_2},\ldots,\vec{\tilde{\nu}}_{i_{n-1}},\vec{\tilde{\mu}}_{i_n}\right)}$$

Choose your King-Plot

Extraction of $\alpha_{\rm NP}$ using the "determinant method" requires

Type of King-Plot	Isotope-Pairs	Transitions	
Generalised King-Plot:	п	n-1	[PRR 2, 043444 (2020)]
No-Mass King-Plot:	п	п	[PRR 2, 043444 (2020)]
	$n \ge 3$ (e	else cannot sea	arch for nonlinearities)
QND = Vol.'	(<i>n</i>	2)! det $\left(\vec{ ilde{ u}}_{1}, . \right)$	$\ldots, \vec{\tilde{\nu}}_{n-1}, \vec{\tilde{\mu}} \Big)$
$Vol.' _{th,\alpha_{NP}} =$	$= \varepsilon_{i_1,\ldots,i_{n-1}} \det \left(X_{i_1} \vec{\tilde{\gamma}}, \vec{\tilde{\nu}}_{i_2}, \ldots, \vec{\tilde{\nu}}_{i_{n-1}}, \vec{\tilde{\mu}}_{i_n} \right)$		
$\alpha_{ND} = \frac{Vol.}{}$	= (n-1)!	$\det\left(\vec{\nu_1},\vec{\nu_2},.\right.$, $\vec{\nu}_{n}$)
Vol. $ _{th,\alpha_{NP}=1}$	$_{L} = \varepsilon_{\mathbf{i}_1, \mathbf{i}_2, \dots, \mathbf{i}_n} d$	$et\left(X_{\mathbf{i}_{1}}\vec{\gamma},\vec{\nu}_{\mathbf{i}_{2}},\right.$	$\ldots, \vec{\nu}_{i_n})$

Outline

Introduction to King-Plots

Isotope Shifts The King-Plot Construction Bounds on New Bosons

Global Fit to King-Plot Data

Ytterbium King-Plots

Which is the "right" upper bound?

Limits on α_{NP} from Ca-data[†], with 2σ uncertainty bars:



[†][PRA 100, 022514 (2019), PRL 115, 053003 (2015), Chin Phys C 45 030003 (2021)] ^{11 of 17}

Kifit: Global Fit to King-Plot Data



in collaboration with Elina Fuchs, Agnese Mariotti and Matteo Robbiati



Towards a systematic treatment of King-Plot data Here: **Ca-data**[‡]



[‡][PRA 100, 022514 (2019), PRL 115, 053003 (2015), Chin Phys C 45 030003 (2021)] ¹³ of 17

Towards a systematic treatment of King-Plot data Here: **Ca-data**[‡]



[‡][PRA 100, 022514 (2019), PRL 115, 053003 (2015), Chin Phys C 45 030003 (2021)] ¹³ of 17

Towards a systematic treatment of King-Plot data Here: **Ca-data**[‡]



[‡][PRA 100, 022514 (2019), PRL 115, 053003 (2015), Chin Phys C 45 030003 (2021)] ¹³ of 17

Current Precision King-Plots



Precision King-Plots in Planning



Outline

Introduction to King-Plots

Isotope Shifts The King-Plot Construction Bounds on New Bosons

Global Fit to King-Plot Data

Ytterbium King-Plots

Ytterbium and its Stable Isotopes









Jean Charles Galissard de Marignac (from Geneva)

Ytterbium and its Stable Isotopes













Ytterbium King-Plot Drama

PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS 128, 163201 (2022)

Featured in Physics

Evidence of Two-Source King Plot Nonlinearity in Spectroscopic Search for New Boson

Joonseok Hur[•],^{1,*} Diana P. L. Aude Craik[•],^{1,*} Ian Counts,^{1,*} Eugene Knyazev[•],¹ Luke Caldwell[•],² Calvin Leung[•], Swadha Pandey[•],¹ Julian C. Berengut[•],³ Amy Geddes,³ Witold Nazarewicz[•],⁴ Paul-Gerhard Reinhard[•],⁵ Akio Kawasaki[•],⁶ Honggi Jeon[•],⁷ Wonho Jhe[•],⁷ and Vladan Vuletić[•],^{1,†}



FIG. 1. Frequency-normalized King plot (top) and residuals (bottom, blue) for the $\gamma (^2S_{1/2} \rightarrow ^2F_{7/2})$ transition and reference transition at $(^2S_{1/2} \rightarrow ^2D_{5/2})$ for even-neighbor pairs (A' = A + 2) of Yb⁺ isotones. A deviation from linearity (red line) by <u>41</u> standard deviations σ sobserved. For reference, residuals for the $\beta ('S_{1/2} \rightarrow 'D_{5/2})$ transition [19], magnified 20-fold, are also plotted in gray. The error bars indicate 2σ uncertainties; for correlations between the errors, see Supplemental Material [24].

Ytterbium King-Plot Drama

PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS 128, 163201 (2022)

Featured in Physics

Evidence of Two-Source King Plot Nonlinearity in Spectroscopic Search for New Boson

Joonseok Hur⊕^{1,*} Diana P. L. Aude Craik●^{1,*} Ian Counts,^{1,*} Eugene Knyazev●¹ Luke Caldwell●², Calvin Leung●¹ Swadha Pandey●¹ Julian C. Berengut●³, Amy Geddes,³ Witold Nazarewicz●⁴, Paul-Gerhard Reinhard●⁵ Akio Kawasaki●⁶, Honggi Jeon●⁷, Wonho Jhe●⁷, and Vladan Vuletić●^{1,†}



FIG. 1. Frequency-normalized King plot (top) and residuals (bottom, blue) for the γ ($^2S_{1/2} \rightarrow ^2F_{7/2}$) transition and reference transition a ($^2S_{1/2} \rightarrow ^2D_{3/2}$) for even-neighbor pairs (A' = A + 2) of Yb⁺ isotopes. A deviation from linearity (red line) by 41 standard deviations or is observed. For reference, residuals for the β ($^2S_{1/2} \rightarrow ^2D_{3/2}$) transition [19], magnified 20-fold, are also plotted in gray. The error bars indicate 2σ uncertainties; for correlations between the errors, see Supplemental Material [24].

$$\begin{split} \bar{\nu}_{\gamma}^{AA'} &= f_{\gamma\tau} + K_{\gamma\tau} \bar{\mu}^{AA'} + G_{\gamma\tau}^{(4)} \overline{\delta\langle r^4 \rangle}^{AA'} + G_{\gamma\tau}^{(2)} \overline{[\delta\langle r^2 \rangle^2]}^{AA'} \\ &+ v_{ne} D_{\gamma\tau} \bar{a}^{AA'}, \end{split}$$

Ytterbium King-Plot Drama

PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS 128, 163201 (2022)

Featured in Physics

Evidence of Two-Source King Plot Nonlinearity in Spectroscopic Search for New Boson

Joonseok Hur[•],^{1,*} Diana P. L. Aude Craik[•],^{1,*} Ian Counts,^{1,*} Eugene Knyazev[•],¹ Luke Caldwell[•],² Calvin Leung[•],¹ Swadha Pandey[•],¹ Julian C. Berengut[•],³ Amy Geddes,³ Witold Nazarewicz[•],⁴ Paul-Gerhard Reinhard[•],⁵ Akio Kawasaki[•],⁶ Honggi Jeon[•],⁷ Wonho Jhe[•],⁷ and Vladan Vuletić[•],^{1,*}



FIG. 1. Frequency-normalized King plot (top) and residuals (bottom, blue) for the γ ($^2S_{1/2} \rightarrow ^2F_{7/2}$) transition and reference transition a ($^2S_{1/2} \rightarrow ^2D_{3/2}$) for even-neighbor pairs (A' = A + 2) of Yb⁺ isotopes. A deviation from linearity (red line) by 41 standard deviations or is observed. For reference, residuals for the β ($^2S_{1/2} \rightarrow ^2D_{3/2}$) transition [19], magnified 20-fold, are also plotted in gray. The error bars indicate 2σ uncertainties; for correlations between the errors, see Supplemental Material [24].

$$\begin{split} \bar{\nu}_{\gamma}^{AA'} &= f_{\gamma\tau} + K_{\gamma\tau} \bar{\mu}^{AA'} + G_{\gamma\tau}^{(4)} \overline{\delta \langle r^4 \rangle}^{AA'} + G_{\gamma\tau}^{(2)} \overline{[\delta \langle r^2 \rangle^2]}^{AA'} \\ &+ v_{ne} D_{\gamma\tau} \bar{a}^{AA'}, \end{split}$$

Story to be continued...

Stay tuned for isotope shift news:

• Kifit: Global King Fits

• Ytterbium King-Plot Analysis

...with fresh record-breaking precision data from PTB (frequencies) and Heidelberg (isotope masses) + theory & interpretation from Darmstadt, Sydney, Hannover and PTB

Thank you for your attention.

(No-Mass King-Plot:)

$$\begin{split} \vec{\nu_1} = & K_1 \vec{\mu} + F_1 \overrightarrow{\delta\langle r^2 \rangle} + \alpha_{\text{NP}} X_1 \vec{\gamma} \\ \vec{\nu_2} = & K_2 \vec{\mu} + F_2 \overrightarrow{\delta\langle r^2 \rangle} + \alpha_{\text{NP}} X_2 \vec{\gamma} \\ \vec{\nu_3} = & K_3 \vec{\mu} + F_3 \overrightarrow{\delta\langle r^2 \rangle} + \alpha_{\text{NP}} X_3 \vec{\gamma} \\ \Rightarrow \det(\vec{\nu_1}, \vec{\nu_2}, \vec{\nu_3}) = & \alpha_{\text{NP}} \det(\vec{K}, \vec{F}, \vec{X}) \det(\vec{\mu}, \overrightarrow{\delta\langle r^2 \rangle}, \vec{\gamma}) \\ \Rightarrow & \alpha_{\text{NP}} = \frac{Vol}{Vol|_{th,\alpha_{\text{NP}}=1}} = \frac{\det(\vec{\nu_1}, \vec{\nu_2}, \vec{\nu_3})}{\det(\vec{K}, \vec{F}, \vec{X}) \det(\vec{\mu}, \overrightarrow{\delta\langle r^2 \rangle}, \vec{\gamma})} \\ = \frac{\det(\vec{\nu_1}, \vec{\nu_2}, \vec{\nu_3})}{\frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_{ijk} \det(X_i \vec{\gamma}, \vec{\nu_j}, \vec{\nu_k})} \end{split}$$

Overlap of new physics potential and electronic wavefunction

$$X_i = \int \mathrm{d}^3 r \frac{e^{-m_\phi r}}{r} \left[|\psi_b(r)|^2 - |\psi_a(r)|^2 \right]$$

 $|\psi(r)|^2$: electron density in absence of new physics, a, b initial, final states

Requirement for searches for new light bosons:

- At least one of ψ_a or ψ_b should have good overlap with new potential.
- For tight bounds on α_{NP} , one X_i needs to be large.