

Solar Neutrinos

Davide Franco, APC



1914 James Chadwick and others showed experimentally that electron spectrum from ²¹⁰Bi beta decay is continuous and not mono energetic like with alphas and gammas. Energy-momentum not conserved in beta-decays?



1928 new problem related to the integer **spin (= 1)** measured for the **nitrogen** nucleus but 14 protons + 7 electrons corresponds to an odd number of fermions.

1930 Pauli proposed the existence of an unknown neutral particle of spin 1/2 within the nucleus, which he called neutron:

- (7 protons + 7 "neutrons") x 1/2 = possible integer
- "neutron" is emitted together with electron in the beta decays = continuous spectrum

1932 Chadwick **observes** experimentally the true **neutron**, much more massive than the electron (Nobel Prize 1935)

1933 Fermi proposes a theory of the beta decay and he calls **neutrino** the Pauli particle

1934 Hans Bethe and Rudolf Peierls calculated the cross-section for the inverse reaction in which a neutrino is absorbed, but when they found a value of about 10⁻⁴⁴ cm². They concluded that no one would be able to detect neutrinos





First detection with reactor neutrinos by Cowan and Reines in 1956

First deficit observed with solar neutrinos with the Ray Davis' experiment in the late 1960s





B. Pontecorvo, Inverse beta processes Chalk River Report, Pd-205, 1946

Pontecorvo proposes to detect neutrinos via inverse beta decay with a radiochemical approach

For completeness, we will mention also some inverse β processes produced by other particles than a neutrino; an inverse β process, more generally, can be defined as the transformation of a neutron into a proton, or vice versa, produced artificially by bombardment with neutrinos, electrons, or γ -rays. These processes are:

(b) Absorption of a neutrino with emission of a β particle

$$\nu + Z \rightarrow \beta^- + (Z+1)$$
 $\nu + Z \rightarrow \beta^+ + (Z-1).$

Pontecorvo considered the following reaction

$$\nu + {}^{37}\text{Cl} \longrightarrow e^- + {}^{37}\text{Ar}$$

(i) C_2Cl_4 is a cheap, nonflammable liquid.

(ii) ³⁷Ar nuclei are unstable (K-capture) with a half-life of 34.8 days

(iii) A few atoms of ³⁷Ar (rare gas), produced during the exposition time, can be extracted from a large detector with high efficiency





The first neutrino detection exploiting a **reactor** at the Savannah River Plant (South Carolina)



11 m from the reactor and 12 m underground

average rate of 3 neutrino events per hour



1956 - Cowan and Reines



On June 14, 1956, Reines and Cowan sent a telegram to Pauli at CERN: "We are happy to inform you that we have definitely detect neutrinos from fission fragments by observing inverse beta decay of protons. Observed cross section agrees well with expected 6x10⁻⁴⁴ cm²".

The theoretically predicted cross section for inverse beta decay on protons is 6.3x10⁻⁴⁴ cm² with an uncertainty of about 25 percent arising from the uncertainty of the energy spectrum for the reactor neutrinos.

The Sun

	Internal st radia convect Prominence Coronal Hole	ructure: by cone in zone Photosphere Photosphere Sun spots Flare Chromosphere
Distance from the Earth	~150,000,000 km	Corona
Light travel time to the Earth	~8 min	
Radius	696,000 km	
Mass	~2 x 10 ³⁰ kg	
Composition by mass	74% H, 25% He, 1% others	
Composition by # of atoms	92.1% H, 7.8% He, 0.1% others	
Mean density	1.4 g / cm ³ (150 g / cm ³ in the core)	
Mean temperature	Surface: 5,800 K, Center: 1.55x107 K	
Luminosity	3.86x10 ²⁶ W	

The Sun

The Sun is an average "main sequence" star:

- same chemical composition: 75% H, 25% He
- fuelled by thermonuclear reactions in the core
- lies in the Hertzsprung-Russell diagram

 $L = 4\pi R^2 \sigma T^4$

Kelvin-Helmholtz contraction and chemical reactions **do not produce enough energy** to maintain solar brightness for billions of years

Energy is generated by **thermonuclear reactions in its core**, where temperature, density and pressure are tremendously high to push light atoms to fuse into heavy ones, e.g., hydrogen fusion.

40,000 20,000 10,000 5000

Surface temperature (K)

2500

$$\Delta m = 4 m_H - m_{He}$$

= 4 × 1.67353 × 10⁻²⁷ kg - 6.64648 × 10⁻²⁷ kg
= 4.76578 × 10⁻²⁹ kg = 0.7%(4m_H)

 $E = \Delta mc^2 = 4.29 \times 10^{-12} J \sim 26.8 MeV$

Net energy input: nuclear fusion energy Net energy output: radiation

The energy release by **1g of hydrogen** through fusion is

 $E = 4.29 \times 10^{-12} J \times 1g/(4 \times 1.67353 \times 10^{-27}) = 6.39 \times 10^{11} J \sim 4 \times 10^{27} MeV$

Equilibrium and energy transfer

Photons take O(10⁵) years to escape the Sun

- Hydrostatic equilibrium is a force balance: gas pressure and radiation pressure work against gravity
- Thermal equilibrium is an energy balance: the same amount of energy enters and leaves a layer
- Energy transfer inside the Sun (stars) by radiation and convection: by radiation, energy is carried away in photons with temperature gradient; by convection, energy is transported by gas flows
- The Sun's energy is transported from the 15 MK center outward by radiation in the radiative zone and then convection in the convective zone.

The interior of the Sun can be "observed" by its oscillations in brightness, size, and velocity on surface

The Standard Solar Model

Ingredients

Conservation laws and material dependent equations

- Mass conservation
- Hydrostatic equilibrium
- Energy conservation
- Energy transport
- Equation of state
- Expression for entropy
- Nuclear reaction networks and reaction rates
- Energy production
- Opacity

This quantity describes the coupling between radiation and matter in the hot dense interior of the Sun Impacted by "**metallicity**", the abundance of metals, id est, elements heavier than He

Assumptions

- no mixing in core or in radiative zone
- hydrostatic equilibrium, i.e. model passes through a stage of equilibria
- the only time dependence is introduced by reduction of H and build up of He in core

Helioseismology is the study of the structure and dynamics of the Sun through its oscillations

Doppler image of the Sun taken by the MDI instrument on board the SOHO satellite

- ranging from roughly -2 km s⁻¹ (dark tones) to +2 km s⁻¹ (light tones)
- The dominant grading is due to the Sun's rotation
- The residual when this and other large-scale motions are corrected for reveals the Sun's resonant-mode oscillations

Trapped acoustic waves, or pressure P mode waves, refracted in the interior by increased temperature and reflected below the surface by low density

- they produce a quasi-sinusoidal radial variation in the velocity field with an amplitude of a few hundred m/s and period of 5 min
- long wavelength waves travel deeper into the sun.

Trapped acoustic waves

Helioseismology and the SSM

Excellent agreement (up to 2009!)

The proton-proton chain

The energy production in the Sun

The CNO cycle

Solar Neutrinos

Homestake

1964 John Bahcall and Ray Davis have the idea to detect solar neutrinos using the reaction

 $^{37}Cl + v_e \longrightarrow ^{37}Ar + e^{-}$

Bahcall's demonstration that transitions to excited states in ³⁷Ar, particularly the superallowed transition to the analog state at 4.99 MeV, **increased the ⁸B cross section by a factor of 40**. This suggested that Davis's detector would have the requisite sensitivity to detect ⁸B neutrinos, thereby accurately determining the central temperature of the Sun

1967 Homestake experiment starts taking data

- 0.61 kiloton of perchloroethylene (C2Cl4)
- 1500 m (4900 m.w.e.) underground
- ³⁷Ar extracted chemically every few months (single atoms!) and decay counted in counting station (35 days half-life)
- event rate: ~1 neutrino capture per day !

814 keV threshold for exciting the ³⁷Ar ground state

Extraction. ³⁷Ar, as a noble gas, can be removed readily from perchloroethylene by a helium purge

Circulation and trapping. Argon is circulated through a condensor, a molecular sieve, and a charcoal trap cooled to the temperature of liquid nitrogen. Typically \sim **95% of the argon in the tank is captured** in the trap.

Efficiency monitoring. The efficiency is determined each run from the recovery results for a known amount of carrier gas, ³⁶Ar or ³⁸Ar, introduced into the tank at the start of the run. When the extraction is completed, the trap is heated and swept by He.

Purification. The extracted gas is passed through a hot titanium **filter** to remove reactive gases, and then other noble gases are separated by gas **chromatography**.

Counting. The purified argon is loaded into a small proportional counter along with tritium-free methane, which serves as a counting gas. Signal:
2.82 keV Auger electron from electron capture decay of ³⁷Ar. The counting of the gas typically continues for about one year (~10 half lives).

Chlorine

The measured **cosmic ray-induced background** in the Homestake detector is **0.06** ³⁷Ar atoms/day

Neutron-induced backgrounds are estimated to be <0.03 atoms/day.

A signal of 0.48 \pm 0.04 atoms/day is expected from solar neutrinos. Taking into account of detector efficiencies, 37Ar decays occurring in the tank, etc., the number of ³⁷Ar atoms counted is about 25/year

1968 First results with only 34% of predicted neutrino flux:

$$\langle \sigma \phi \rangle_{^{37}Cl} = 2.55 \pm 0.17 \pm 0.18 \text{ SNU}$$

1 SNU = the neutrino flux producing 10⁻³⁶ captures per target atom per second

To be compared to the BP and TCL SSM predictions of 8.0 ± 1.0 SNU and 6.4 ± 1.4 SNU, respectively, all with 1σ errors

Solar neutrino problem is born - for next 20 years no other detector!

Homestake

At first, the scientific community thought the experiment must be wrong, but Davis insisted he was right. "The solar neutrino problem caused great consternation among physicists and astrophysicists", Davis wrote. "My opinion in the early years was that something was wrong with the standard solar model; many physicists thought there was something wrong with my experiment."

The Kamiokande Experiment

4.5 kiloton cylindrical imaging water Cerenkov detector

Designed for proton decay searches and later re-instrumented to detect low energy neutrinos.

It detects recoiling electrons from the elastic scattering reaction, 7 times more sensitive to electron neutrinos than to muon and tau ones

$$\nu_x + e \rightarrow \nu'_x + e'$$

Detection with Cherenkov light

The Cerenkov radiation from a muon produced by a muon neutrino event yields a well defined circular ring in the photomultiplier detector bank.

> The Cerenkov radiation from the electron shower produced by an electron neutrino event produces multiple cones and therefore a diffuse ring in the detector array.

23, 3-25,

Davide Franco - APC

- Active volume: 2.14 kt
- Fiducial volume: 0.68 kt
- 948 Hamamatsu 20" PMTs (20% optical coverage)
- Veto: 1.5 m thick water surrounding the active volume equipped with 123 PMTs
- Shielded by 2700 m.w.e. of rock at the Kamioka mine

The result from the combined Kamiokande II/III data set is

$$\phi_{\nu_e}(^{8}\text{B}) = (2.91 \pm 0.08 \pm 0.12) \cdot 10^{6} / cm^{2}s$$
 (1 σ)

corresponding to 51% of the BP SSM prediction. The total number of detected solar neutrino events is 476^{+36}_{-34}

Remarks

It is the first detector to measure solar neutrinos in **real time**

Angular allows the experimenters to separate solar neutrino events from isotropic background.

First direct demonstration that the Sun produces neutrinos as a byproduct of fusion.

Recoil spectrum is reduced in amplitude but **not distorted in shape** with respect to predictions

SuperKamiokande

SuperKamiokande

Davide Franco - APC

SuperKamiokande

"for pioneering contributions to astrophysics, in particular for the detection of cosmic neutrinos"

Raymond Davis Jr.

Masatoshi Koshiba

Lowering the energy threshold down to 233 keV: sensitive to pp neutrinos!

$$v_e + {^{71}Ga} \rightarrow {^{71}Ge} + e^-$$

SAGE: Soviet-American Gallium Experiment

- Baksan Neutrino Observatory, northern Caucasus
- 50 tons of metallic 71Ga
- 2000 m deep, 4700 m.w.e. => $\Phi\mu$ ~ 2.6 m⁻² day⁻¹

GALLEX / G.N.O. : GALLium EXperiment

- Gran Sasso Underground Laboratory, Italy,
- 30.3 tons of gallium in 101 tons of gallium chloride (GaCl₃ -HCl) solution
- 1400 m deep, 3300 m.w.e.=> $\Phi\mu \sim 30 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ day}^{-1}$

SAGE

- 1. Metallic gallium as a target
- 2.71Ge is separated by vigorously mixing into the gallium a mixture of hydrogen peroxide and dilute hydrochloric acid.
- 3. This produces an emulsion, with the Ge migrating to the surface of the emulsion droplets where it is oxidized and dissolved by hydrochloric acid.
- 4. The Ge is extracted as GeCl4, purified and concentrated, synthesized into GeH4, and further purified by gas chromatography. The overall efficiency is typically 80%.
- 5. The GeH4 is inserted into miniaturized gas proportional counters, carefully designed for their radiopurity Ge counted as it decays back to Ga (τ 1/2 = 11.43 d)

GALLEX / GNO

- 1. Solution of GaCl3 in hydrochloric acid as a target
- 2.Ge is recovered as GeCl4 by bubbling nitrogen through the solution and then scrubbing the gas through a water absorber.
- 3. The Ge is further concentrated and purified
- 4. Converted into GeH4, mixed with Xe, and extracted with 99% efficiency
- 5. The GeH4 is inserted into miniaturized gas proportional counters, carefully designed for their radiopurity Ge counted as it decays back to Ga (τ 1/2 = 11.43 d)

Gallium

Expected: 122 - 131 SNU

GNO	62.9 ± ^{6.0} _{5.9} SNU
GALLEX	77.5 ± ^{7.6} _{7.8} SNU
GALLEX+GNO	69.3 ± 5.5 SNU
SAGE	66.9 ± ^{5.3} _{5.0} SNU

Problem 1. Calculated versus Observed Absolute Rate

- **Deficit** observed at the Chlorine experiment with respect to the SSM prediction

Problem 2. Incompatibility of Chlorine and Water (Kamiokande) Experiments

- ⁸B spectral shape in Kamiokande agrees with expectations. Rescaling the rate to the Homestake energy threshold, the chlorine experiment should observe 3.2 ± 0.45 SNU from 8B neutrinos only, which exceeds the total observed chlorine rate of 2.55 ± 0.25 SNU.

Problem 3. Gallium Experiments: No Room for ⁷Be Neutrinos

- GALLEX and SAGE observed rate is 70.5±7 SNU
- To be compared with 73 SNU from pp + pep neutrinos from the model (known at 1% accuracy thanks to the luminosity constraint) + 7 SNU from 8B as rescaled from Kamiokande + 34 ± 4 SNU expected from 7Be => ~134 SNU
- No room for ⁷Be neutrinos

Neutrino mixing

The Mikheyev-Smirnov-Wolfenstein Mechanism: the density dependence of the neutrino effective mass could greatly enhance oscillation probabilities: a v_e is adiabatically transformed into a v_{μ} as it traverses a critical density within the Sun.

Neutrino mixing

Survival Probabilities










































for the discovery of neutrino oscillations, which shows that neutrinos have mass



Takaaki Kajita



Arthur B. McDonald





Total Rates: Standard Model vs. Experiment





The puzzle is going to be solved... but only a small fraction of 8B neutrinos were observed in real time. In total less than 1% of the entire solar neutrino flux was detected



Before Borexino





One fundamental input of the Standard Solar Model is the metallicity of the Sun - abundance of all elements above Helium:

The Standard Solar Model, based on the old metallicity derived by Grevesse and Sauval (Space Sci. Rev. 85, 161 (1998)), was in agreement within 0.5 in % with the solar sound speed measured by helioseismology.



Latest work by Asplund, Grevesse and Sauval (Nucl. Phys. A 777, 1 (2006)) indicates a lower metallicity by a factor ~2. This result destroys the agreement with helioseismology

Revised model in 2009 by Serenelli, Basu, Ferguson, Asplund (Astrophys.J.705:L123-L127,2009) slightly reduced the discrepancy.



What about neutrinos?

[cm ⁻² s ⁻¹]	pp (10 ¹⁰)	pep (10 ¹⁰)	hep (10 ³)	⁷ Be (10 ⁹)	⁸ B (10 ⁶)	¹³ N (10 ⁸)	¹⁵ O (10 ⁸)	¹⁷ F (10 ⁶)
GS 98	5.97	1.41	7.91	5.08	5.88	2.82	2.09	5.65
AGS 09	6.03	1.44	8.18	4.64	4.85	2.07	1.47	3.48
Δ	-1 %	-2 %	-3 %	-9 %	-18 %	-27 %	-30 %	-38 %





Real time detection, via elastic scattering, from 200 keV









Davide Franco - APC





 Borexino detects solar v via their elastic scattering off electrons in a volume of highly purified liquid scintillator

- ✓ Mono-energetic **0.862 MeV** ⁷**Be v** are the main target, and the only considered so far
- \checkmark Mono-energetic pep v , CNO $v\,$ and possibly pp v will be studied in the future
- ✓ Detection via scintillation light:
 - ✓ Very low energy threshold
 - ✓ Good position reconstruction
 - ✓ Good energy resolution

BUT...

- ✓ No direction measurement
- The v induced events can't be distinguished from other β events due to natural radioactivity

Extreme radiopurity of the scintillator is a must!





Expected solar neutrino rate in 100 tons of scintillator ~ 50 counts/day (~ 5 10⁻⁹ Bq/kg)

Just for comparison:

Natural water	~ 10 Bq/kg in 238 U, 232 Th and 40 K
Air	~ 10 Bq/m ³ in ³⁹ Ar, ⁸⁵ Kr and ²²² Rn
Typical rock	~ 100-1000 Bq/kg in 238 U, 232 Th and 40 K

BX scintillator must be 9/10 order of magnitude less radioactive than anything on earth!

 Low background nylon vessel fabricated in hermetically sealed low radon clean room (~1 yr)

• **Rapid transport** of scintillator solvent (PC) from production plant to underground lab to avoid cosmogenic production of radioactivity (⁷Be)

- Underground purification plant to distill scintillator components.
- Gas stripping of scintlllator with special nitrogen free of radioactive ⁸⁵Kr and ³⁹Ar from air

• All materials **electropolished SS or teflon**, precision cleaned with a dedicated cleaning module











Counting Test Facility

- ✓CTF is a small scale prototype of Borexino:
- \checkmark ~ 4 tons of scintillator
- ✓ 100 PMTs
- ✓ Buffer of water
- ✓ Muon veto
- ✓ Vessel radius: 1 m





CTF demonstrates the Borexino feasibility











Radiolsotope		Concentration or Flux		Strategy for Re		
Name	Source	Typical	Required	Hardware Software		Achieved
μ	cosmic	~200 s ⁻¹ m ⁻²	~ 10 ⁻¹⁰	Underground	Cherenkov signal	<10 ⁻¹⁰
		at sea level		Cherenkov detector	PS analysis	(overall)
Ext. y	rock			Water Tank shielding	Fiducial Volume	negligible
Int. y	PMTs, SSS			Material Selection	Fiducial Volume	negligible
	Water, Vessels			Clean constr. and handling		
14 C	Intrinsic PC/PPO	~ 10-12	~ 10 ⁻¹⁸	Old Oil, check in CTF	Threshold cut	~ 10 ⁻¹⁸
238	Dust	~ 10 ^{-5_} 10 ⁻⁶ g/g	< 10 ⁻¹⁶ g/g	Distillation, Water Extraction		~ 2 10 ⁻¹⁷
²³² Th	Organometallic (?)	(dust)	(in scintillator)	Filtration, cleanliness		~ 7 10 ⁻¹⁸
7Be	Cosmogenic (12C)	~ 3 10 ⁻² Bq/t	< 10 ⁻⁶ Bq/ton	Fast procurement, distillation	Not yet measurable	?
40 K	Dust,	~ 2 10 ⁻⁶ g/g	< 10 ⁻¹⁴ g/g scin.	Water Extraction	Not yet measurable	?
	PPO	(dust)	< 10 ⁻¹¹ g/g PPO	Distillation		
210 Pb	Surface contam.			Cleanliness, distillation	Not yet measurable	?
	from 222Rn decay				(NOT in eq. with ²¹⁰ Po)	
²¹⁰ Po	Surface contam.			Cleanliness, distillation	Spectral analysis	~ 14
	from ²²² Rn decay				α/β stat. subtraction	~ 0.01 c/d/t
222Rn	air, emanation from	~ 10 Bq/I (air)	< 1 c/d/100 t	Water and PC N ₂ stripping,	Delayed coincidence	< 0.02 c/d/t
	materials, vessels	~100 Bq/I (water)	(scintillator)	cleanliness, material selection		
³⁹ Ar	Air (nitrogen)	~17 mBq/m³ (air)	< 1 c/d/100 t	Select vendor, leak tightness	Not yet measurable	?
⁸⁵ Kr	Air (nitrogen)	∼ 1 Bq/m³ in air	< 1 c/d/100 t	Select vendor, leak tightness	Spectral fit	= 25±3
				(learn how to measure it)	fast coincidence	$= 29 \pm 14$

Borexino







First results with 740 days livetime

7Be Rate: 46.0±1.5stat+1.6-1.5 syst cpd/100 tons

 $fBe = 0.97 \pm 0.05$





Borexino





Borexino: ⁸B neutrinos



 μ (+ secondaries) + ¹²C $\rightarrow \mu$ (+ secondaries) + ¹¹C + n



 ${}^{11}C \rightarrow {}^{11}B + e^+ + v_e$





Borexino: the pep and CNO range









Borexino: pep neutrinos





Borexino: pp neutrinos















Borexino: CNO neutrinos











Borexino: CNO neutrinos











Non-standard interactions? Sterile neutrinos? Metallicity?

















Figure 6: Diagram of the JUNO detector. The 20 kt LS is contained in a spherical acryne vesser with an inner diameter of 35.4 m, and the vessel is supported by stainless steel latticed shell and the shell also holds about 18,000 pieces of 20-inch PMTs and 25,000 pieces of 3-inch PMTs.



Dual-Phase Noble Liquid TPC





Property	Argon	Xenon
Atomic No. (Z)	18	54
Max recoil energy (% of incident n energy)	9.5	3.0
Boiling point	87.3	165
Density (g/cc)	1.4	3.0
Electron mobility (cm2/v*s)	400	2200
lon drift velocity at 1kV/cm (mm/µs)	2.2	2.4
Energy resolution (FWHM@ 662 keV) scint. only (%)	8%	8%
Scintillation wavelength (nm)	128 (WLS /doping) also NIR	175 (UV quartz PMT window)
Scintillation yield (photons/MeV)	40000	42000
Fast decay time (ns)	7 (25% light)	4.3
Slow decay time (ns)	1500 (75% light)	22 (100% in ≤ 22 nm)


Liquid Xenon / Argon

