more on [the theoretical uncertainties of] the signal

i.e. towards refined hydrodynamic simulations^{1,2}

Mikko Laine

(AEC, ITP, University of Bern)

¹ Supported by the SNF under grant 200020-168988.

² Based on collaborations with Jacopo Ghiglieri and Greg Jackson.

introduction

we are interested in measuring the $T_{\mu\nu}$ correlator

in a stationary state, gravitational waves are emitted with rate

$$\frac{\,\mathrm{d} e_{\rm GW}}{\,\mathrm{d} t\,\mathrm{d}^3 {\bf k}} \;=\; \frac{2\,C_\Delta^{\rm TT}(k)}{\pi^2 m_{\rm Pl}^2}\;,$$

where the transverse-traceless correlator reads (${f k}\equiv k\,{f e}_z)$

$$C_{\Delta}^{\mathrm{TT}}(k) \equiv \int_{(t,\mathbf{x})} e^{ik(t-z)} \left\langle \frac{1}{2} \left\{ T^{xy}(t,\mathbf{x}), T^{xy}(0) \right\} \right\rangle$$

at low frequencies $T^{\mu\nu}$ is given by hydrodynamics

with p= pressure, w= enthalpy density, $u^{\mu}=$ flow velocity, the energy-momentum tensor reads

$$T^{ij} \approx T^{ij}_{\text{ideal}}, T^{ij}_{\text{ideal}} \equiv pg^{ij} + wu^i u^j$$

 \Rightarrow problem: if the equation of state possesses a phase transition, the solution becomes singular within a finite period of time³

³ e.g. L.D. Landau and E.M. Lifshitz, *Fluid Mechanics*.

as a regulator, viscous corrections can be included

$$\Rightarrow T^{ij} = T^{ij}_{ideal} + \Delta T^{ij}$$
 where⁴

$$\Delta T^{ij} = -\eta \Big(u^{i;j} + u^{j;i} - \frac{2g^{ij}u^{\gamma}_{;\gamma}}{3} \Big) - \zeta g^{ij}u^{\gamma}_{;\gamma} + S^{ij} ,$$

here η, ζ are the shear and bulk viscosities, and S^{ij} is noise with

$$\langle S^{xy}(\mathcal{X})S^{xy}(\mathcal{Y})\rangle = 2\eta T \,\delta(\mathcal{X}-\mathcal{Y}) \;.$$

 \Rightarrow fluctuation-dissipation theorem requires that noise be present; as a consequence, even without flow,

$$\lim_{k \to 0} C_{\Delta}^{\rm TT}(k) = 2\eta T .$$

⁴ E.M. Lifshitz and L.P. Pitaevskii, *Statistical Physics, Part 2*, §88-89.

paradox: in a weakly coupled system η is "large"

if there were no interactions, particles would fly freely, and long-range correlations would persist \Rightarrow large fluctuations

in kinetic theory, $\eta \sim 1/\sigma$, where σ is a cross section related to kinetic equilibration

at
$$T \gg 100 \text{ GeV}$$
, $^5 \eta \simeq rac{16T^3}{g_1^4 \ln(5T/m_{\mathrm{D1}})} \simeq 400 \, T^3.$

⁵ S. Jeon, Hydrodynamic transport coefficients in relativistic scalar field theory, hep-ph/9409250; P.B. Arnold, G.D. Moore and L.G. Yaffe, Transport coefficients in high temperature gauge theories. 1. Leading log results, hep-ph/0010177; Transport coefficients in high temperature gauge theories. 2. Beyond leading log, hep-ph/0302165.

nevertheless the noise contribution is invisible to LISA



main stuff

we now move on to a "2-component system": $T^{\mu\nu} + \phi$

 $T^{\mu
u}$ is modified by a contribution from an "order parameter":

$$\begin{split} T^{\mu\nu}_{\text{ideal}} &\equiv & w \, u^{\mu} u^{\nu} + p \, g^{\mu\nu} + \phi^{,\mu} \phi^{,\nu} - \frac{g^{\mu\nu} \phi_{,\alpha} \phi^{,\alpha}}{2} , \\ p &\equiv & p_0(T) - V(\phi,T) , \quad w \equiv T \partial_T p \end{split}$$

$\Rightarrow V(\phi, T)$ may contain a first order transition

equation of motion for ϕ involves friction⁶

the dissipative coefficient γ couples ϕ to the thermal background:

$$T^{\mu
u}_{;\mu} = 0 \; , \ \phi^{;\mu}_{;\mu} - \gamma \, u^\mu \phi_{,\mu} - \partial_\phi V = 0 \; .$$

. . . .

 \Rightarrow finite wall velocity, entropy production, and equilibration

⁶ J. Ignatius, K. Kajantie, H. Kurki-Suonio and ML, *The growth of bubbles in cosmological phase transitions*, astro-ph/9309059; M. Hindmarsh, S.J. Huber, K. Rummukainen and D.J. Weir, *Shape of the acoustic gravitational wave power spectrum from a first order phase transition*, 1704.05871.

then equation of motion for ϕ should also include noise

close to equilibrium, e.o.m. should be completed into

$$\phi^{;\mu}_{;\mu} - \gamma \, u^\mu \phi_{,\mu} - \partial_\phi V + \xi = 0 \; ,$$

where ξ is a noise term, whose magnitude is completely fixed:

$$\langle \xi(\mathcal{X})\xi(\mathcal{Y}) \rangle = 2\gamma T \,\delta(\mathcal{X} - \mathcal{Y}) \;.$$

contribution of γ to gravitational wave production

consider now $\delta T^{xy} = \phi^{,x} \phi^{,y}$ and average over fluctuations

$$\Rightarrow \ \delta C_{\Delta}^{\rm TT}(k) = \frac{2T^2}{\gamma} \int_{\mathbf{p}} \frac{p_x^2 p_y^2}{(p^2 + m^2)^2} \left(1 + \frac{\gamma^2}{p^2 + m^2} \right)$$

on a fine space-time lattice ($rac{1}{a_{\!s}}\gg\,m,\,\gamma$),

$$\delta C_{\Delta}^{\mathrm{TT}}(k) \approx \frac{2T^2}{\gamma} \int_{\mathbf{p}} \frac{\tilde{p}_x^2 \tilde{p}_y^2}{\tilde{p}^4} = \frac{T^2}{\gamma} \times \frac{\Gamma^2 \left(\frac{1}{24}\right) \Gamma^2 \left(\frac{11}{24}\right) (\sqrt{3}-1)}{288\pi^3 a_s^3}$$

 $\Rightarrow \delta C_{\Delta}^{\mathrm{TT}}$ scales as $rac{T^2}{\gamma}$, has a flat shape, and can be tuned at will

summary: why include fluctuations in hydrodynamics?

 \Rightarrow their tunable absolute magnitude ($\sim T^2/\gamma$) and known shape may help to "calibrate" the measurement algorithm

 \Rightarrow "spherical bubbles don't radiate", but in reality bubbles aren't quite spherical; noise is necessary for probing their instability⁷

 \Rightarrow in many models, noise generates first order transitions⁸

 \Rightarrow in principle, noise automatically takes care of nucleations⁹

⁷ e.g. P.Y. Huet, K. Kajantie, R.G. Leigh, B.H. Liu and L.D. McLerran, *Hydrodynamic stability analysis of burning bubbles in electroweak theory and in QCD*, hep-ph/9212224.

⁸ e.g. B.I. Halperin, T.C. Lubensky and S.-K. Ma, *First-Order Phase Transitions in Superconductors and Smectic-A Liquid Crystals*, PRL 32 (1974) 292.

⁹ e.g. G.D. Moore, K. Rummukainen and A. Tranberg, *Nonperturbative computation of the bubble nucleation rate in the cubic anisotropy model*, hep-lat/0103036.

epilogue: sometimes one can get inspiration from QCD

the theory and practice of hydrodynamic fluctuations have recently become a hot topic for heavy ion collision hydrodynamics¹⁰

¹⁰ e.g. P. Kovtun and L.G. Yaffe, *Hydrodynamic fluctuations, long time tails, and* supersymmetry, hep-th/0303010; P. Kovtun, G.D. Moore and P. Romatschke, *The stickiness* of sound: An absolute lower limit on viscosity and the breakdown of second order relativistic hydrodynamics, 1104.1586; J.I. Kapusta, B. Müller and M. Stephanov, *Relativistic Theory* of Hydrodynamic Fluctuations with Applications to Heavy Ion Collisions, 1112.6405; Y. Akamatsu, A. Mazeliauskas and D. Teaney, *Bulk viscosity from hydrodynamic fluctuations* with relativistic hydro-kinetic theory, 1708.05657.